



The Americas in European Music Encyclopedias

Part I

ENGLAND (AND SCOTLAND)

Thomas Busby (1755-1838) compiled the first music lexicon reprinted in the United States, *A Complete Dictionary of Music* (Philadelphia: G.M. & W. Snider, 1827). Continental precedents would have permitted Busby's alluding to American Indian music (Jean-Jacques Rousseau, 1768) or mentioning New World composers whose names were circulating in Europe by the 1790's (José Mazza). Busby did neither. Instead his geographic biases permitted his snubbing even Spain, mother of American colonies. In the xxxiv + 331-page "fourth edition with additions and improvements" of his *A Dictionary of Music* (London: Printed for Richard Phillips, 1817), Busby offered these definitions (pages 45, 52, 246-247).

CANARIES. The name of an old dance, of which we have a sample in Purcell's opera of *Dioclesian*. It is a sprightly air of two strains; the time, three quavers in a bar, the first pointed. None of the foreign airs are distinguished by any name analogous to this; we have, therefore, reason to conclude that the *Canaries* is of English invention.

CHACONNE. (French.) An air, borrowed from the Arabians; the characteristic of which is a ground bass, consisting of four or eight measures of triple time of three crotchets, with its repetition to continually varied melodies. The *Chaconne* somewhat resembles the *Sarabande* but is rather more grave, has the first and last crotchet of every bar strongly accented, and was formerly used as an accompaniment to a certain dance, slow, and graceful in its movement.

SARABANDE. A dance said to be originally derived from the Saracens. According to some authors, it had its appellation from a comedian named *Sarabandi*, who first introduced it in France. The tune of the *Sarabande* is written in $\frac{3}{4}$ or $\frac{3}{8}$, and its character is both expressive and majestic. One of its distinguishing features is the lengthening of the second note of the measure, which at once gives a gravity and consequence to the movement.

Not until George Grove (1820-1900) did British musical lexicography begin welcoming American information. In contrast with all other chief English writers on music through World War I, Grove experienced America directly. From November 14, 1841, to June 1843 he superintended the construction of a lighthouse at Morant Point on Jamaica.¹

¹Summary of the diary Grove kept while in Jamaica in Charles L. Graves, *The Life & Letters of Sir George Grove, C.B.* (London: Macmillan and Co., 1903), pp. 22-23. "In the [Jamaica] diary itself no hint is discernible of his literary tastes, but a clue as to the way in which he spent some of his leisure moments is to be found at the other end of the same note-book, where he has copied out a number of poems by Moore, Wordsworth, Shelley, Keats, and Coleridge." Grove made no observations on the singing of the Jamaica Blacks assigned to help with lighthouse construction but does record that on August 13, 1842, his life was saved by Blacks who got a ladder up to him while he dangled in danger of falling sixty feet.



From April 20, 1844, to August 6, 1848, he did the same for a lighthouse on Gibb's Hill, Bermuda.

On September 5, 1878, now 58, he sailed from Liverpool as a travelling companion of Arthur Penrhyn Stanley, Dean of Westminster Abbey. Landing September 16 at Boston, he met Charles Eliot, Oliver Wendell Holmes, Henry Wadsworth Longfellow, and numerous other cultural and political leaders. He spent September 20 with Charles Francis Adams (1807-1886; minister to England 1861-1869), who gave him Adams family history particulars for his diary of the trip. Upon hearing the Harvard Musical Society sing "Believe me if all those endearing young charms" he noted in his diary that it was the college song. At fashionable Trinity Church of which Phillips Brooks was rector and James Cutler Dunn Parker organist, he approved the "excellent singing of the solo quartet." Visits to Wellesley, Hartford, New Haven, New York, Philadelphia, and Baltimore brought him into personal contact with more college presidents and professors. At Philadelphia, he and Dean Stanley who had preached at St. James's Church on Sunday morning September 29 visited Bethel African Methodist Episcopal Church that evening. Grove's diary unsympathetically records the "violent contrasts of *forte* and *piano*, without any reference to the text, which characterized the singing of the coloured congregation."²

At Washington he and Dean Stanley met President Rutherford B. Hayes and visited the Admiralty Museum. After Mount Vernon next came Richmond, whence Grove departed on a three-day side trip that took him to the Blue Ridge Mountains 25 miles below Lynchburg. Returning north, Grove rejoined Dean Stanley at New York. Albany, Niagara, Quebec, Montreal, Lake George and Lake Champlain, "seat of much of the old wars," followed in that order. On October 23 they stopped at Saratoga and on October 25 spent the day with 75-year-old Ralph Waldo Emerson at Concord. On October 29 they travelled back to New York, there meeting other "scores of distinguished Americans" ranging from Henry Ward Beecher to Theodore Thomas.

In 1879, the year after this momentous trip, appeared the first volume of the dictionary that was to immortalize Grove. He began the preface to volume 1 of his *A Dictionary of Music and Musicians (A.D. 1450-1880) by eminent writers, English and foreign* (London: Macmillan and Co., 1879) with this fine American gesture: "A growing demand has arisen in this country and in the United States for information on all matters directly and indirectly connected with Music." So far as American contributors of articles on American subjects go, the most persistent throughout all four volumes (1879, 1880, 1883, 1889 [with appendix added by J.A. Fuller Maitland]) was the Massachusetts-born Francis Henry Jenks (Nantucket, June 2, 1838; Roxbury [Massachusetts], December 9, 1894).

Son of Samuel Haynes Jenks, member of the Boston Handel and Haydn Society June 1, 1815 to January 1, 1828, F.H. Jenks studied organ at Berlin with Dorn before settling in Boston as church organist and writer for the *Globe*, *Advertiser*, and *Courier*. From 1881 to his death he served the patrician *Transcript* as both music and drama critic. From 1884 to 1886 he was librarian of the Handel and Haydn Society (of which he had been a member since November 1, 1865). His Episcopal church organ appointments included St. Peter's on Massachusetts Avenue in Cambridge and St. James's, Roxbury.

²*Ibid.*, p. 234. Dean Stanley called the sermon a "hideous exhibition." Percy M. Young, *George Grove 1820-1900 A Biography* (London: Macmillan, 1980), p. 146, gratuitously surmised that Philadelphia AME Blacks on this occasion sang from Southern shape-note books (*Sacred Harp. The Southern Harmony*) that were the property of whites.



The four volumes of the first edition contain 25 articles by Jenks.³ However, the sole article with an extensive bibliography and that quotes examples is "Negro Music of the United States" (five music notations, three taken from *Slave Songs of the United States* [New York: A. Simpson and Company, 1867]). According to Jenks, John Andrew Broekhoven (1852–1930) of the Cincinnati College of Music "has written a suite for orchestra based on creole tunes, which has been performed at concerts in the United States."⁴ Jenks in this same article properly defers to Gottschalk as the first who incorporated Negro music in piano pieces.

Another Jenks article (sufficiently viable to survive into *The New Grove*) profiles Julius Eichberg, resident in Boston after 1859. In his section on the United States concluding the Opera article (III, 529–530) Jenks justly signals Eichberg's *The Doctor of Alcantara* as "the most successful work of any pretensions with an exclusively American reputation." Although omitted from Chase's textbook on *America's music*, Eichberg—rated the most successful Jewish⁵ composer of theater music as well as music educator in nineteenth-century America—found due recognition in at least one unbiased textbook preceding Chase's, Louis C. Elson's *The History of American Music* (New York: Macmillan, 1904)—pages 344–346 of which include a portrait and a facsimile manuscript page from an Eichberg song to Tennyson lyrics. Jenks also profiled the managerial careers of the Jewish Maurice and Max Strakosch, "brothers well known in the United States for a quarter of a century as entrepreneurs of operatic and concert ventures." Jenks's 490-word article on the Jewish Leopold Damrosch (1832–1885; portrait and biography in Elson, omitted by Chase) concludes with a detailed works-list reaching 19 opus-numbers published in Germany and an almost equal quantity of music published in the United States.

Apart from Jenks, Massachusetts-born contributors to the first edition of Grove included also Henry Ware, Alexander Wheelock Thayer, and (Hiram) Clarence Eddy. Colonel Henry Ware, longtime Keeper of Bates Hall at Boston Public Library,⁶ contributed a 510-word article on "Dwight's Journal of Music" (*A Dictionary*, I [1879], 478) that can be flavored in these excerpts:

For six years (1852–1858) Dwight was editor, publisher, and proprietor of the Journal, the publication of which was then assumed by Oliver Ditson & Co. During the war it was changed from a weekly to a fortnightly paper. . . . Dwight has been sole editor up to this day, although the

³Boston Musical Societies, Dudley Buck, Leopold Damrosch, Oliver Ditson & Co., Clarence Eddy, Julius Eichberg, Stephen Collins Foster, Patrick Gilmore, Handel and Haydn Society (Boston), Harvard Musical Association, Benjamin Johnson Lang, Mendelssohn Quintette Club, Negro Music, Opera (United States), John Knowles Paine, Peabody Concerts, Philharmonic Society of New York, Adelaide Phillipps, Frédéric Louis Ritter, Maurice and Max Strakosch, Symphony Society (New York), Theodore Thomas (United States), J. Baxter Upham, Carl Zerrahn.

⁴Comprising three movements (Calinda, Theme and variations, Humoresque), Broekhoven's *Suite Creole* (New York: J. Fischer & Brother, 1929) had to wait forty years for publication. In *America's music* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1955, 1966), pp. 397–398, Gilbert Chase ignores Broekhoven's 1880 priorities, instead lauding Gilbert's symphonic treatment of New Orleans Black themes in *The Dance in Place Congo* as something novel.

⁵Albert Ehrenfried, *A Chronicle of Boston Jewry, from the Colonial Settlement to 1900* (Boston: Privately Printed, 1963), p. 698. Among other prominent Jewish musical figures, Ehrenfried lists Louis Charles Elson, critic, editor, and author of *The History of American Music* (1904), and Emmanuel Fiedler, father of the Boston Pops conductor Arthur Fiedler.

⁶Walter Muir Whitehill, *Boston Public Library A Centennial History* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1956), p. 114.



volumes contain valuable contributions of other pens. Among the most noticeable are those from A.W. Thayer, the biographer of Beethoven, who has written for it many valuable biographical and historical articles, as well as musical tales. Especially noteworthy are his articles on some of the contemporaries of Beethoven—Salieri, Gyrowetz, Gelinek, Hummel, and others. Professor Ritter and his wife (now of the Vassar Female College), W.S.B. Mathews of Chicago, and C.C. Perkins of Boston, have also contributed frequent and valuable articles to its columns. . . . During the whole period of its existence, over 100 musical papers have arisen—and in great part disappeared—in the United States.

In the "musical libraries" article (the section on the United States is jointly credited to Ware and William Barclay Squire, II, 426-427), Harvard University, Harvard Musical Association, and Boston Public Library are each credited with owning approximately "2000 volumes of music"; the "Library of Congress has little but what comes to it under the copyright law, which is considerable in quantity"; the Cincinnati College of Music "enjoys the use of Theodore Thomas's collection of several thousand volumes of orchestral works"; the "Lowell Mason library of music, belonging to the theological department of Yale College . . . now contains 8460 distinct publications and 630 MSS"; the "Yale College library has a small but valuable collection, comprising about 300 volumes of music, and 100 of musical literature, gathered principally with the income of a fund given by the late Mrs. William S. Larned."

Alexander Wheelock Thayer, cataloguer of the Lowell Mason library "the nucleus of which was bought at Darmstadt in 1852," contributed the Lowell Mason article to the 1880 volume (II, 225), but with an ellipsis that makes Mason's *Musical Letters from Abroad* published in 1853 a collection dating from his first (1837) rather than second European trip, and with a misprint of the year in which New York University gave him a doctor of music degree (should be 1855, not 1835). All the rest of Thayer's twenty articles in *A Dictionary*⁷ deal with Beethoven associates or associations. These are uniformly superb, and their length testifies to Grove's generosity, so far as wordage is concerned. Subsequent editions through the fourth continued carrying Thayer's Beethoven-associated articles on the Breuning family, Lichnowsky, Lobkowitz, Maelzel, Rasoumowsky, Ries family, Archduke Rudolph, and George Thomson (also Lowell Mason). But as an example of retrenchment, Thayer's 1360-word article on Archduke Rudolph written in 1881 for publication in volume 3 (1883) turns up in the third edition (1927) reduced to 1090 words, and in the fifth (1954) to a mere 500. (Elliot Forbes's 360-word article on "Beethoven's greatest patron" in *The New Grove* calls the Archduke's mother María Luisa of Spain "Maria Ludovika.")

Thayer's sole article surviving substantially intact through all editions from *A Dictionary* (II [1880], 194-195) to *The New Grove* deals with Maelzel. Among the few changes, *The New Grove* condenses Thayer's Winkel allusion. Dietrich Nikolaus Winkel (Lippstadt, Westphalia, 1776; Amsterdam, September 28, 1826) did have his claim to priority over Maelzel vindicated, according to Thayer's 1880 article (the earliest extant Winkel metronome is dated 1814).⁸ So far as additions go, *The New Grove* takes into account the Standley Howell article, "Beethoven's Maelzel Canon," *Musical Times*, cxx/1642 (December 1979), 987-990. Echoing "Schindler's Beethoven Forgeries," *Musical Times*, cxviii/1613 (July 1977), 549-552, Howell pro-

⁷Breuning family, Galitzin, Gallenberg, Kinsky, Lichnowsky family, Lobkowitz, Louis Ferdinand (Prince), Maelzel, Lowell Mason, Rasoumowsky, Ries family, Archduke Rudolph, Schwarzspanierhaus, Sebald, Sina, Standenheim, Stein family, Stutterheim, George Thomson, Weissenbach, Willmann family.

⁸Photograph in *Grote Winkler Prins*, xiii (Amsterdam: Elsevier, 1971), 124; see also xx (1975), 183.



posed that the "Beethoven" canon WoO 162 purportedly antedating the Allegretto of the Seventh Symphony is a Schindler forgery concocted to vindicate Schindler's notorious zest for slower tempi than were the vogue in February 1844 when he first published the canon.⁹

Thayer's 1880 article should also have been corrected in *The New Grove* from "Maelzel does not appear to have gone to London" to: "Maelzel visited London in the Spring of 1815."¹⁰ Other desirable additions: Beethoven mentioned Maelzel (but with a misspelling) in a letter dated as early as February 2, 1795.¹¹ Between 1813 and 1818 Salieri played a paramount part in publicizing Maelzel's chronometer and metronome.¹² Maelzel made his headquarters between 1830 and 1838 at Philadelphia, supporting himself with exhibitions of his Automatic Trumpeter at Fifth Street below Adelphi and of his diorama, "The Burning of Moscow," at Eighth and Chestnut Streets.¹³ Among Maelzel's Philadelphia associates, Thayer in *A Dictionary* (but not *The New Grove*) cited George Allen (1808-1876), professor of Greek and Latin at the University of Pennsylvania, as authority for Maelzel's death circumstances. Joseph J. Mickley was the Philadelphia friend in whom Maelzel confided the Beethoven reminiscences cited in Thayer's biography.¹⁴

The earliest American composer whose biography Grove himself wrote for his dictionary is Samuel Holyoke (1762-1820), the Harvard graduate (1789) whose 650 published pieces made him the most prolific New England composer of the Federal epoch. In his 125-word article, Grove commends Holyoke for having eschewed "imitations and 'fugues'" in *Harmonia Americana* ("printed in type at Boston, 1791"), and for having instead introduced "homophony and common sense in his hymn-tunes and other pieces." In the same article Grove mentions Holyoke's having cooperated with Oliver Holden in producing *The Massachusetts Compiler*. However, Grove dignifies neither Billings, Holden, nor any other New England fusing-tune practitioner with a separate biographical entry.¹⁵

Chronologically, the next American whose article Grove himself wrote was Thayer (*A Dictionary*, iv, 1889], 98-99), born at South Natick, Massachusetts, October 22, 1817. Although antedating Thayer's decease at Trieste July 15, 1897, by a decade, Grove's 625-word article better delineates Thayer than does *The New Grove* 450-word

⁹Autograph lost; bibliography in Georg Kinsky, *Das Werk Beethovens*, ed. Hans Halm (Munich-Duisburg: G. Henle Verlag, 1955), p. 671.

¹⁰Camille Pleyel wrote his parents a letter dated at London May 23, 1815, in which he said that "Not long ago Maelzel gave a large dinner for artists on behalf of his Chronometer at which Cramer, Ries, Kalkbrenner, and others were present, but I don't know whether all this will take him far" (Rita Benton's translation in "London Music in 1815, as Seen by Camille Pleyel," *Music and Letters*, xlvii/1 [January 1966], p. 41).

¹¹Zoltán Falvy, "Beethovens Beziehungen zu Ungarn," *Musica* (Bärenreiter), x/2 (February 1956), pp. 125-128.

¹²Rudolph Angermüller, "Aus der Frühgeschichte des Metronoms. Die Beziehung zwischen Mälzel und Salieri," *Oesterreichische Musikzeitschrift* xxvii/3 (March 1971), pp. 134-140.

¹³Robert A. Gerson, *Music in Philadelphia* (Philadelphia: Theodore Presser Co., 1940), p. 394.

¹⁴Thayer, *Ludwig van Beethovens Leben*, IV (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1907), p. 65, letter from Philadelphia dated May 21, 1873, in which Maelzel quoted Beethoven as calling the metronome a "dummes Zeug, man muss die Tempos fühlen."

¹⁵Grove entrusted to William Henry Husk (1814-1887), librarian of the Sacred Harmonic Society 1853 to 1872, the family article on Edward Hodges (1796-1867), organist at Trinity Church, New York, 1846 to 1859, and composer-daughter Faustina Hodges (1823-1895), organist in Brooklyn and Philadelphia. Revised, Husk's Hodges article still inhabits *The New Grove*. Husk also wrote the article on the Horns. (Charles Edward Horn in 1827 emigrated to the United States where he remained—except for the quadrennium in England 1843 to 1847—until death at Boston October 21, 1849.)



article—which ignores such landmarks signaled in 1889 as Thayer's connection with Lowell Mason, his cataloguing of Mason's library bought in Germany, his *Atlantic Monthly* review of Marx's Beethoven (which, translated by Otto Jahn, established his European credentials), and his important, time-consuming non-musical publications.¹⁶

In contrast with Grove's article on Thayer replaced with a less valuable article in *The New Grove*, his article on Perabo persists (suitably revised). His article on Samuel Parkman Tuckerman (1819-1890), the first American to earn the Lambeth degree of Doctor of Music, also persists in *The New Grove*, "revised." But the revision foists an error of fact upon Grove never in the article published by him (iv, 184), lacks any bibliography, and concludes vaguely that Tuckerman "composed a number of anthems and services." Contrary to *The New Grove*, Tuckerman neither in 1864 nor in any other year "became organist of Trinity Church, New York."¹⁷ He did in 1864 edit the *Trinity Collection of Church Music* (Boston: Oliver Ditson), which *The New Grove*, viii, 612, incorrectly states was that year "edited" by Edward Hodges. By denying Tuckerman a works list that contains at least his Services in G, F, and E (published by Novello in 1870, 1871, and 1875), his Burial Service for the famous piano manufacturer Jonas Chickering (published at Boston in 1854), his anthems published by Novello, and his funeral anthem for the slain President James A. Garfield (Boston: Oliver Ditson, 1881), *The New Grove* cuts the feet from under him.

The New Grove lacks any article whatsoever on Eben Tourjée (Warwick, Rhode Island, June 1, 1834-Boston, April 12, 1891), whose admiring two-column biography is Grove's own longest "American" article in *A Dictionary* (ii, 154-155). This 1980 omission is strange, especially in view of the Tourjée article in the *Dictionary of American Biography*, ix, 605. Extending Jenks's list of operas composed by Americans, Grove mentions *Zenobia* by Silas Pratt (iv, 506).

Still another welcome article penned by Grove himself brings the most renowned South American composer of the nineteenth century into *A Dictionary*. His article on Antônio Carlos Gomes gives the premiere dates of *Il Guarany* (La Scala, March 19, 1870; Covent Garden, July 13, 1872) and of *Salvator Rosa* (Genoa, February 21, 1874). He also mentions Gomes's orchestral *Il Saluto del Brasile* conducted by Patrick Gilmore at the Philadelphia 1876 Centennial Exposition on the Emperor Pedro II's initiative¹⁸ and with Pedro II himself present.¹⁹

¹⁶Concerning his non-musical publications, see "American Musical Scholarship: Parker to Thayer," *19th Century Music*, i/3 (March 1978), pp. 205-206, 208. *The New Grove* judgment that Thayer never indulged in musical description needs revision; see "American Musical Scholarship," p. 207.

¹⁷See the complete list of "The Organists of Trinity Parish" in Leonard Ellinwood, *The History of American Church Music* (New York: Morehouse-Gorham, 1953), p. 187; also A.H. Messiter, *A History of the Choir and Music of Trinity Church, New York* (New York: AMS Press, 1970).

¹⁸*The New Grove* article on Antônio Carlos Gomes wrongly dates *Il Saluto del Brasile*. P.S. Gilmore conducted the orchestra that played Gomes's *Il Saluto del Brasile* at Philadelphia in Independence Square, July 4, 1876. That same day Gomes heard his same work played at the American Consulate in Milan. Homer L. Calkin, "Music During the Centennial of American Independence," *The Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography*, c/3 (July 1976), p. 386, published supporting documentation. Pedro II left Philadelphia July 5, 1876, on the 1:25 p.m. train for New York, and remained there until sailing aboard the Cunard liner *Russia* the evening of July 12. See Argeu Guimarães, *D. Pedro II nos Estados Unidos* (Rio de Janeiro: Editora Civilização Brasileira, S.A., 1961), pp. 302, 312.

Nor does *The New Grove* mention the concert of Gomes's works conducted by the composer at Chicago during the World's Columbian Exposition. Concerning Gomes's United States contacts, see "Visión musical norteamericana de las otras Américas hacia 1900," *Revista Musical Chilena*, xxxi/137 (January-March 1977), pp. 28-34.

¹⁹Guimarães, pp. 296-298.

Pedro II's next dated objective after the American centennial was the opening of the theater at Bayreuth August 12.²⁰ En route, he stopped briefly at London (which he had already visited in the summer of 1871). On Sunday July 23 after assisting at Mass in the Spanish Church,²¹ he visited Westminster Abbey. Because scheduled to leave for the Continent Monday, he told Grove's friend Dean Stanley:²²

I do not wish to see the Abbey at length, because I have seen it before, but I wish to see one or two things that I omitted to see on the former occasion [July 3, 1871],²³ the grave of Livingstone and the monument of Dr. Blow, the organist.

Commenting on Emperor Pedro II's search for Blow's monument, Grove added that the Emperor asked Stanley:²⁴

"Do you know where it is?" Yes, Stanley knew, and took the Emperor to the tomb which is in the north aisle behind the organ. Standing before the monument, the Dean read the inscription to the Emperor, and it is said—though I will not vouch for this—that the Emperor hummed the upper line of the music which is engraved on the monument.²⁵ The most jealous belief in the English school of music could never have conceived that Dr. Blow's fame would have reached as far as Brazil.

In recompense for Emperor Pedro II's knowledgeability about England,²⁶ Grove showed himself considerably less well informed on anything having to do with South America—or for that matter with Portugal or Spain.²⁷ In his article on Marcos Portugal, who spent 1811 to death February 7, 1830, at Rio de Janeiro, he fell into traps set by Fétis.²⁸ He asked Franz Gehring (1838–1884) to supply the article on Sigismund Neukomm who spent 1816 to April 15, 1821 at Rio de Janeiro. The well-known authority on Wagner and Berlioz, Adolphe Jullien (1845–1932), wrote the unsympathetic 530-word article on Louis Moreau Gottschalk who died in the environs of Rio de Janeiro December 18, 1869 [*A Dictionary*, iv, 652–653]. Not only did Jullien falsify Gottschalk's antecedents by making his father a "Doctor of Science at Cambridge, Massachusetts," and his mother "a daughter of Count Antoine de Bruslé, a colonel of a cavalry regiment and a governor of Saint-Domingue at the time of the insurrection" but also he derogated from Gottschalk's compositions by pronouncing them a mere fad that died with him. Jullien's Gottschalk article abridged but not improved survived in *Grove's Dictionary* as late as the fourth edition (1940, II, 420).

In contrast with the four volumes of *A Dictionary* issued between Grove's 59th and 69th years, James Duff Brown (1862–1914) had the temerity to publish at the age of

²⁰Pedro Calmon, *História de D. Pedro II*, III (No País e no Estrangeiro 1870–1887) (Rio de Janeiro: José Olympio Editora, 1975), p. 1099.

²¹*Ibid.*, p. 1095, note 2.

²²Rowland E. Prothero, *The Life and Correspondence of Arthur Penrhyn Stanley, D.D. Late Dean of Westminster* (London: John Murray, 1893), II, 305.

²³Calmon, *História*, III, 909.

²⁴Graves, *Life and Letters of Sir George Grove*, p. 271.

²⁵Gloria (four-in-one canon) from Blow's *Jubilate in C*. William Barclay Squire, "Blow, John," *Dictionary of National Biography*, II, 725, identifies this Gloria as "said to have been sung at St. Peter's at Rome, where it was introduced by Cardinal Howard [Edward Henry Howard, born February 13, 1829], to whom it was given by the sub-dean of the Chapel Royal, Dr. Ralph Battell."

²⁶Dean Stanley recalled Emperor Pedro II thus (Prothero, II, 305–306): "Of all eminent persons who visited the Abbey, he certainly showed the most minute and extensive knowledge."

²⁷Grove wrote articles on Aguilera de Heredia, Brito, Cerone, Soriano Fuertes, Soto de Langa.

²⁸See below, page 197.



only 24 a 637-page *Biographical Dictionary of Musicians: With a Bibliography of English Writings on Music* (Paisley [Scotland]: Alexander Gardner, 1886). Surely one of the most precocious dictionary-writers in the annals of musical lexicography, Brown all the more deserves our present attention because no other European dictionary-maker before 1980 gave Americans proportionately so much space.

Brown's own life story has thus far been best told in W.A. Munford's 110-page *James Duff Brown 1862-1914 Portrait of a Library Pioneer* (London: The Library Association, 1968). From Munford's first chapter, "Origins—Scotland, books and music," come all the details included in the following précis.

Brown was born at Edinburgh November 6, 1862, into an "unusually gifted musical family." His father "retained a lifelong interest in singing and his mother had an enormous repertory of songs and ballads; his sister, Margaret, became a pianist and concert singer, while his blind brother, Charles, had such acute pitch sense that he could distinguish microtones.

Educated at the Church of Scotland Normal School in Lothian Terrace "at the foot of the Castle Esplanade steps," he left school in July, 1875, to become an apprentice to the bookselling firm of Edmonston and Douglas in Princes Street. In 1876 he moved with his family to burgeoning, half-million population Glasgow where W.R. McPhun and Son, booksellers, of Argyle Street, hired him as junior assistant. In 1878 at age sixteen he began in the same capacity of junior assistant at Mitchell Library, which "had been functioning for one year only, under the direction of its quiet, knowledgeable English librarian, Francis Thornton Barrett."

Endowed with nearly £70,000 by the local tobacco manufacturer Stephen Mitchell, this library grew from 15,000 to 80,000 volumes during Brown's ten-year connection. In 1881, the year that he was promoted to senior assistant, Mitchell Library already subscribed to 300 "serious" British and American periodicals. In 1882 Brown began "collecting materials for a biographical dictionary of musicians." In 1885 Thomas Mason edited a privately printed brochure on public and private libraries of Glasgow that contained Brown's 18-page chapter on Euing's library.

In Brown's words: "This large and important collection of musical works was formed by the late William Euing [1788-1874], insurance broker of Glasgow, and was bequeathed by him to Anderson's University in 1874. . . . Taken as a whole, the library is of surpassing interest and value to the musician." Under "Euing (William)" in his *Biographical Dictionary* he added: "This library is one of the most valuable in Britain, and contains many rare and costly books and old music. The theoretical department is very rich in ancient and modern literature. There is also a unique collection of psalmodies."

The Euing collection, reinforced by the resources of Mitchell Library, substituted for the army of contributors with whom Grove surrounded himself—116 in all, numbering among them such famed Continental scholars as Pohl and Spitta. Brown dared issue his dictionary as a solo effort. Grove was backed by one of the best known publishing houses in Great Britain. Brown's dictionary appeared without music notations, line drawings, or any other ameliorations, and his publisher was a "minor firm"²⁹ never comparable with even such other Scottish houses as A. & C. Black, Blackie & Son, Blackwood, W. & R. Chambers, Collins, and T. & A. Constable—to go no further with an alphabetical listing.

Brown's dictionary lists a total of 5474 musicians or firms (musical publishers and instrument makers) ranging from the seventh-century B.C. Greek Archilochus to Brown's own epoch. The number of United States entries totals 243. Frank O. Jones's

²⁹R.D. Macleod, *The Scottish Publishing Houses* (Glasgow: W. & R. Holmes, 1953), p. 24



182-page *A Handbook of American Music and Musicians*, containing Biographies of American Musicians and Histories of the Principal Musical Institutions, Firms and Societies (Canaseraga, New York: F.O. Jones, 1886) published the same year as Brown's *Biographical Dictionary* runs to 473 entries. Jones acknowledged the aid of seven "well-known musical writers" scattered around the nation: "Karl Merz [1836-1890], Wooster, Ohio; C.H. Brittan, Chicago; Wm. M. Thoms [1852-1913], New York; Wm. B. Tuthill, New York; E.M. Bowman [1848-1913], St. Louis; E. Eugene Davis, Cincinnati; P.J. Smith, Brooklyn." To salute two among these seven, Jones included biographies of Merz and Bowman—but only of these two. Against Jones's seven collaborators, Brown cited five American aides: Mr. W.H. Dana, of Warren, Ohio; Mr. W.H. Daniell, of Boston, Mass.; and Messrs. Karl Merz,³⁰ W.B. Gilbert, and J.C. Fillmore.³¹ With more courtesy than F.O. Jones, Brown itemized the biographies of all five American correspondents cited in his preface.

Just as their informants differed (except for Merz), so also Jones and Brown widely varied in their choice of nineteenth-century biographees. However, their coverage of eighteenth-century New Englanders—a group codified by George Hood's 1846 *History of Music in New England*—showed only occasional discrepancies. Brown did itemize John Cotton (1585-1652),³² John Tufts (1689-1750), Josiah Flagg (1737-c. 1795), Simeon Jocelyn (1746-1823), and Oliver Shaw (1779-1848), not profiled in Jones's *A Handbook*. Additionally, Brown itemized Newark-born James Lyon (1735-1794).³³ But in common, Brown and Jones included Thomas Walter (1696-1725), Benjamin Franklin (1706-1790), William Billings (1746-1800), Andrew Law (1749-1821), Elias Mann (1750-1825), Daniel Read = Reed (1757-1836), Jacob Kimball (1761-1826), Jeremiah Ingalls (1764-1828), Oliver Holden (1765-1844), Samuel Holyoke (1762-1820), and Stephen Jenks (1772-1856). Against the five New England stalwarts in Brown but not Jones, Jones included two early New Englanders who escaped Brown—John Stickney (1742-1826) and Timothy Swan (1758-1842).

So far as their combined total of 18 eighteenth-century choices goes, all except Stickney are confirmed in *The New Grove* (1980).³⁴ However, their nineteenth-century selectees find less ready confirmation in the twenty-volume *New Grove*. Brown and Jones share in common 118 nineteenth-century names. Unfortunately, many of the biographies shared by both Brown and Jones that do persist in *The New Grove* return less well profiled in 1980 than they were in the 1880's. Four examples chosen at random from the letters A through G will clarify.

³⁰Concerning Karl Merz (Bensheim, Hesse, September 19, 1836; Wooster, Ohio, January 30, 1890), see *Dictionary of American Biography*, vi/2 [x11], 576-577. A comparison of Jones's with Brown's biography of Merz instances the differences between the two. Brown, although much more succinct, mentions Merz's valuable "52 biographies of eminent American and other musicians in *Brainard's Musical World*" of which he became sole editor in 1873.

³¹After absence from the fifth edition, John Comfort Fillmore (Franklin, Connecticut, February 4, 1843; Taftville, Conn., August 14, 1898) emerged in *The New Grove*, vi, 547-548, with an article listing his college teaching appointments but chiefly commending him for "transcribing some 200 Indian melodies which otherwise might not even have been printed."

³²Cotton's 72-page *Singing of Psalmes, a gospel-ordinance* (London: 1647, 1650), ends with part 4, "teaching the manner of singing."

³³Jones's *A Handbook*, p. 109, itemizes Lyon's *Urania*.

³⁴Cross-reference identifications of Tufts, Walter, Flagg, Jocelyn, Swan, and Ingalls in *The New Grove* do not define their accomplishments and should be replaced by articles. Like the omitted Stickney, Flagg was a pioneer compiler, and not as incorrectly stated (vi, 624) a "composer."



FREDERIC(K) ARCHER¹⁵ (1838-1901) lacks any bibliography whatsoever in *The New Grove (Dictionary of American Biography lists Musical Courier*, New York, 1898, vol. 37, no. 1; *Musical Times*, London, December 1901; Henry C. Labee, *The Organ and its Masters*, 1902) or works list (*Concert Fugue* in *Organist's Journal*, No. 9, *Concert variations* and *Marche triomphale*, London, Novello, Ewer & Co., 1872 and 1894; *The Organ, a theoretical und practical treatise*, Novello, Ewer & Co., 1867, 1875, 1880; *Method for American Reed-Organ*, New York, G. Schirmer, 1889). Despite his English origins, *The New Grove* article leaves his life a blank between 1852 and 1873.

DUDLEY BUCK¹⁶ (1839-1909) concludes with a bibliography listing only one item—Gallo's own unpublished dissertation. Where are any of the numerous significant published items beginning

¹⁵Brown's article reads (pp. 23-24):

ARCHER (Frederic). English comp. and org., B. Oxford, June 16, 1838. Chorister of Margaret Chap., London. Org. at Royal Panopticon, after Dr. Chipp, till its close. Org. of Merton Coll. Org. at the Alexandria Palace, London. Director of an English Opera Company. Cond. for a season (1878-80) of Glasgow Select Choir. Resident in America, as org. in H. Ward Beecher's Ch., Brooklyn etc., and as editor of the *Keynote*.

WORKS.—The Organ: A Theoretical and Practical Treatise intended to assist the Student in acquiring a sound knowledge of the Instrument and its proper manipulation, with a series of Original Exercises and Illustrative Compositions written specially for this work, London: Novello & Co., n.d.; The Collegiate Organ Tutor, London: Weekes & Co., n.d.; Adagio Maestoso for organ; Fugue for organ, in D minor; Grand Fantasia in F, for organ; Andantes for organ, in D, F, and A; Concert Variations for organ; Marche Triomphale for organ; Set of twelve organ pieces, intended chiefly for church use; Two Gavottes for Pf. in D, and E flat; Polka de Salon, for Pf.; Three Impromptus for Pf.; Bourrée in C, for Pf.; Requited Love, part song; Night, part song; The Chase, part song; O give thanks, anthem; The glorious majesty, anthem. *Songs*: My Lady's Face; I'm sister to the cure (comic); King Wittlaff's drinking horn; Arrangements for organ, Pf., choir, etc.

Archer is a very good organist, a successful conductor, and a moderately good composer. His organ playing is marked by much technical ability and a careful observance of the composer's leading meaning. In many respects—and this by reason of his careful regard for the production of legitimate effects—he may be said to rank among the foremost of living organists. His compositions display cleverness, but are neither inspired nor inspiring. He is most successful when writing for his adopted instrument, the organ.

¹⁶Brown (pp. 124-125):

BUCK (Dudley). American comp., org., and pianist, B. Hartford, Connecticut, March 10, 1839. S. at Trinity Coll., Hartford. S. at Leipzig Cons. along with A. Sullivan, J.F. Barnett, S.B. Mills, etc., 1858, under Hauptmann, Richter, Rietz, Moscheles, and Plaiddy. S. afterwards at Dresden under Schneider (organ) and Rietz (harmony, etc.). Resided in Paris, 1861-2. Returned to United States, 1862. Choir-master of S. Paul's Ch., Boston. Org. of Music Hall, Boston, 1871. Assistant cond. under Mr. Theodore Thomas at the Central Park Garden, New York, 1875. Org. and choir-master of Ch. of the Holy Trinity, Brooklyn, 1875. Director of the "Apollo Club," Brooklyn. Resides in Brooklyn as teacher, etc.

WORKS.—*Cantatas*: Scenes from the Golden Legend, by Longfellow, 1880 (this work gained a \$1,000 prize at Cincinnati); The Legend of Don Munio, 1874; "The Centennial Meditation of Columbia" (for the opening of the Exhibition at Philadelphia), 1876, written by Sidney Lanier; Easter Morning, for mixed voices; Hymn to Music, for chorus of mixed voices. Forty-sixth Psalm (God is our Refuge), for solo voices, chorus, and orch.; The Nun of Nidaros, chorus for male voices; King Oloff's Christmas, chorus for male voices, with solo. *Church Music*: Motette Collection, 1867, Second Motette Collection; Morning Service for Episcopal Ch., op. 25; Evening Service, do., op. 31; Christ our Passover, anthem, op. 29; There were Shepherds, anthem; Hark! what mean these holy voices? hymn, op. 32; Darkly rose the guilty Morning, anthem, op. 33; Morning Service, op. 45; Evening Service, op. 47; Easter Anthem, op. 46; Christmas Anthem, op. 48; Special Hymns (in Anthem form) for Quartet or Chorus Choir, op. 43 (8 numbers); Three Anthems, op. 72; Te Deum and Jubilate from Schubert's Mass in B flat; O Saviour, hear me! offertory from Gluck; A Midnight Service for New Year's Eve. *Organ*: Illustrations in Choir Accompaniment, with Hints in Registration, 4to, 1877; Grand Sonata in E flat, op. 22; Concert Variations on "The Star Spangled Banner," op. 23; Triumphant March, op. 26; Impromptu Pastorale, op. 27; Eighteen Pedal Phrasing Studies, 2 books, op. 28; Rondo Caprice, op. 35; Transcription Overture to "William Tell," op. 37; Trans. from Beethoven's "Sonata op. 28," op. 38; Transcription Overture to "Stradella," op. 39; Trans. from



as early as John Cornelius Griggs, *Studien über die Musik in Amerika* (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1894) and Dudley Buck: *A Complete Bibliography* (New York: G. Schirmer, 1910)? The works-list wrongly dates *The Nun of Niduros* as 1905 instead of 1879. *The Legend of Don Munio* was published at Boston, not New York (text by Dudley Buck, not Longfellow); *The Light of Asia* at London, not New York; *King Olaf's Christmas* at New York, not London. *Choir Accompaniment* and *Illustrations in Choir Accompaniment*, listed as two separate works, are one and the same work (copyrighted in 1877, reissued 1880, 1888, 1913). *The Light of Asia* was first performed in England at St. James Hall, London, March 19, 1889, not in 1885. The works list mentions neither Buck's *In Springtime Symphony*, *Marmion Symphonic Overture* (Brooklyn, December 12, 1887; premiered by Theodore Thomas), nor any of his works for solo instruments and orchestra (scores in Library of Congress), and omits all organ works—including the two important Sonatas in E♭ and G minor.

CLARENCE EDDY¹⁷ (1851–1937) in *The New Grove* rates a tired undocumented eleven lines carried over from two previous editions without bibliography or improvements of any kind. On the other hand, Grove's *A Dictionary*, iv (1889), 625–626, gave him 47 lines. Eddy himself contributed the article on Albert Loeschhorn (1819–1905) to the first edition of Grove and continued on the roster of contributors through the third edition. The foremost American organ recitalist of his epoch, Eddy merited a 103-line article replete with bibliography in the *Dictionary of American Biography*, xi/2 (1940), 168–169. *Who Was Who in America*, I (Chicago: Marquis-Who's Who, 1968), 357, continued listing his publications. At least two articles should enter the bibliography: W.S.B. Mathews's "Clarence Eddy, Organ Virtuoso," *Music* (Chicago), vii (1894–95), 492–502, and "Clarence Eddy on American organs," *Music*, xx (1898–99), 615–619.

Schumann's Pictures from the Orient, op. 40; Variations on a Scotch Air, op. 51; At Evening, Idylle, op. 52; the Last Rose of Summer, with variations, op. 59; Second Grand Sonata, in G minor, op. 77; The Organist's Repertoire, edited by Buck and S.P. Warren, etc. *Vocal Music: The Tempest*, Dramatic Poem, for voice and Pf.; Five Songs for alto or baritone voice and Pf., words by E.C. Stedman; Three Songs for mezzo-soprano; Five Songs for soprano or tenor. Symphonic Overture, "Marmion," for full orch. "Deseret," a comic opera, libretto by W.A. Croffut, 1880. Pianoforte Music. *Dictionary of Musical Terms*, Boston, n.d. The Influence of the Organ in History, 1882.

The compositions of this composer, though almost entirely confined to the United States, are of such sterling quality as to merit their production elsewhere. His chief works are the cantatas, which have attained considerable popularity in the United States. Apart from his powers as a composer, Mr. Buck is one of the greatest organists in the United States. His church music is remarkable for effective treatment without vulgarity or undue straining, and his organ music is good, if somewhat brilliant. Buck has trained many good musicians, and his influence in the United States is great.

¹⁷Brown (pp. 227–228):

EDDY (Hiram Clarence). American org., comp., and cond., B. Greenfield, Mass., June 23, 1851. S. under J.G. Wilson of Greenfield, and under Dudley Buck, at Hartford, Conn., 1867. Org. of Bethany Cong. Ch. (Dr. Lord), Montpelier, Vt., till 1871. S. at Berlin Haupt and Loeschhorn, 1871. Org. Dr. Goodwin's ch., Chicago. Director of the Hershey School of Musical Art, Chicago, 1876. Cond. of the Philharmonic Vocal Society, Chicago. Married to Sarah Hershey.

WORKS.—Canons, preludes, fugues, variations, etc., for organ; Church music, songs, etc.: Translation of Haupt's "Theory of Counterpoint and Fugue," etc.

Mr. Eddy holds a foremost place among American organists, by reason of his great technical ability, extensive repertory, and poetical interpretation of classical works. The programmes of his "National Concerts" are marked by an admirable selection of composers, and good variety of works. Thus the "English" programmes contain the names of Ouseley, Wesley, Carter (H.), E.J. Hopkins, Macfarren, Smart, Best, and Archer, the representative works chosen giving a good general idea of the modern school of English organ music. The "American" school is equally well represented by Gleason, E. Thayer, J.K. Paine, D. Buck, S.G. Pratt, Whitney, West, Whiting, and Eddy. The design of these national concerts forms part of a large scheme which some time previous to June 1879 Mr. Eddy projected. He gave a series of 100 organ recitals, each programme containing fresh matter, and without the repetition of a single number. The successful completion of this feat was accomplished June 23, 1879.



FREDERICK GRANT GLEASON (1848-1903), a major United States composer of his epoch, settled in Chicago two decades before the year for his moving there given in *The New Grove*. Grace Hiltz should not be mentioned unless Mabel Blanche Kennicott whom he married October 19, 1887, at Chicago is also mentioned. To say that *Montezuma* went "unperformed" must be qualified by the statement that the introduction to the second act was performed with great acclaim during the National Music Teachers' Convention at the Academy of Music, New York City, July 2, 1885 (reviewed in *American Art Journal*, LIV/3 [November 7, 1885], 33-34). *The New Grove* article lacks a works-list and itemizes only Rupert Hughes (1900) and John Tasker Howard (1931) in a Bibliography that should instead include W.S.B. Mathews, "Mr. Frederick Grant Gleason," *Music* (Chicago), XIII (1897-98), 331-338 (Gleason's works-list, opp. 1 through 24 at 337-338 includes Concerto for piano and orchestra, op. 19, and three trios for piano, violin, and cello, opp. 9, 13, 14); Aileen M. Peters, "Analysis of Frederick Grant Gleason Collections, of Music, Scrapbooks, and Diaries," Master of Education thesis, Department of Library Science, Chicago Teachers College South, August 1965.

The delicate question of whom to select and whom to reject from a 1980 "all-inclusive" lexicon cannot be settled by an appeal to 1880's precedent. Nonetheless, the following thirty-odd entries sampled from Brown still ring too familiarly in the ears of Americanists (United States) for the exclusion of all of them from *The New Grove* to be easily endorsed: Silas Brainard (1814-1871), Hart Pease Danks (1834-1903), Theodor Eisfeld (1816-1882), Stephen Emery (1841-1891), Amy Fay (1844-1928), Robert Goldbeck (1839-1908), Nathaniel Gould (1781-1864), Theodor Hagen (1823-1871), George Hood (1807-1882), Julie Rivé-King (1857-1937), Charles (1840-1923) and Jacob Kunkel (1846-1882), Henry Lahee (1856-1953), George Washington Lucas (1800-1880), Max Maretzek (1821-1897), William Smythe Babcock Mathews (1837-1912), Sebastian Bach Mills (1838-1898), John Weeks Moore (1807-1889), George Osgood (1844-1922), Horatio Richmond Palmer (1834-1907), Albert Ross Parsons (1847-1933), Carlyle Petersilea (1844-1903), Frédéric Louis Ritter (1826[sic]-1891), Theodore Frelinghuysen Seward (1835-1902), William Hall Sherwood (1854-1911), Lucien Southard (1827-1881), Samuel Prowse Warren (1841-1915), Myron William Whitney (1836-1910), Richard Storrs Willis (1819-1900), Hermann Wollenhaupt (1827-1863), Carl Zerrahn (1826-1909), Charles Zeuner (1797-1857), John Zundel (1815-1882).

Brown heard Moody and Sankey in both Edinburgh and Glasgow. He therefore knew at first hand what others called American treacle or trash. His including numerous gospel song exponents anticipated *The New Grove* that only now at last begins profiling Bradbury, Sankey, and their formerly despised ilk. Brown also gave the black Justin Holland (1819-1886) a berth denied him elsewhere in lexicography until Eileen Southern wrote him up for *The New Grove*.

Leaving Brown and returning to Grove: no English-language multi-volume music encyclopedia from the first edition to the present *New Grove* has ever risen to compete with successive editions of *Grove*.

John Alexander Fuller Maitland (1856-1936), who from 1889 to 1911 was music editor of the London *Times*, edited the second edition (five volumes 1904, 1906, 1907, 1908, 1910). Deferring to his own profession, he chose for his favorite authors of new articles on United States subject-matter two New York newspaper critics, Richard Aldrich (1863-1937; music editor of the *New York Times* 1902-1923) and Henry Edward Krehbiel (1854-1923; *New York Tribune* music critic 1880-1923). To in-



stance how implicitly Fuller Maitland relied on these two fellow critics, he replaced the 2240-word article on "United States" in the first edition with a 34-word subject-entry "United States" in the second edition that does no more than cross-reference eleven other articles in the second edition, all of which (except one enlarged holdover on "Negro Music of the United States") are new articles by Aldrich or Krehbiel.³⁸ Also it was Krehbiel who wrote the articles on the two Americans whose biographies with appended works-lists occupy most lavish space in Fuller Maitland's edition—MacDowell (III, 4–6) and Horatio Parker (III, 622–623). Both these articles remained in *Grove* through both third and fourth editions (1927–1929, 1939–1940) edited by Fuller Maitland's successor as London *Times* critic, Henry Cope Colles (1879–1943).

Aldrich who "joined Krehbiel in contributing the American articles to the second edition of *Grove* in 1904–10" became the "main contributor of articles on American topics for the third edition." Himself an aristocratic New Englander who had graduated from Harvard College in 1885, Aldrich studied music in Germany 1888–1889 and published Wagnerian opera guides in 1904 and 1905. Not finding Aldrich or any of his ilk equal to the drudgery of generating data on unglamorous American phases, Macmillan was forced to look beyond him or any other prominent New York newspaper critic for someone to edit an American supplement to the second edition of *Grove*.

From the moment such a supplementary sixth volume was bruited, the publishers imposed two conditions: (1) it must provide United States purchasers with a volume intensively covering their own music (= art music); (2) it must at the same time update information on European topics and personalities included in the five-volume main series. The Hartford Theological Seminary church music teacher to whom Macmillan entrusted this double-edged assignment, Waldo Selden Pratt (1857–1939), accepted it with great reluctance—realizing full well the impossibility of producing a neat volume. For his aide, Pratt chose Charles Newell Boyd (1875–1937), whose *Lectures on Church Music for the use of students in the Western Theological Seminary, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania* had been published in 1912. However, "shortly after the supplementary volume of *Grove* appeared in 1920, an independent edition of the American volume printed from the same plates appeared in America with the imprint of the Theodore Presser Company under the title: *American Music and Musicians*. The name of Charles N. Boyd is absent from the title-page of this edition."³⁹ Pratt's part was therefore fundamental.

Never during his long publication career extending from 1880 (*Two Essays on the Columnar Architecture of the Egyptians*, Boston: American Academy of Arts and Sciences) to the year of his death 1939 (*The Music of the French Psalter of 1562; a historical survey and analysis, with music in modern notation*, New York: Columbia University Press) did Pratt himself undertake any personal research in American music history beyond what was required for the *American Supplement*. In 1937 he did publish *A Forgotten American Portrait-Painter: Peter Baumgras, 1827–1903*.

³⁸Aldrich wrote "American Guild of Organists," "Boston Musical Societies"; Krehbiel contributed "Cincinnati Musical Festivals," "New York Musical Societies," "Opera in the United States," "Periodicals (United States)," "Worcester Festival." Cooperatively they wrote "Symphony Concerts in the United States."

³⁹Otto Kinkeldey, "Waldo Selden Pratt, November 10, 1857–July 29, 1939," *Musical Quarterly*, xxvi/2 (April 1940), p. 171.



Nothing equivalent came from his ever industrious pen dealing with any "forgotton American Psalmist." Even when discoursing on church music topics, he limited himself to such a compiled list of titles as "American Church Hymnals Published Since 1880" at pages 174-176 in his *Musical Ministries in the Church* (New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1901; four later editions). His righteous article "On Behalf of Musicology" opened the maiden number of *The Musical Quarterly* (January 1915), pages 1-16. But for him, musicological research seems always to have demanded worthier topics than native American-tongue hymnals, fusing tunes, antebellum rural music in the South, sea shanties, periodicals published elsewhere than on the Eastern coast, California mission music, music in Mormon settlements, West Coast mining camp songs, musical comedy, cakewalk, ragtime, jazz.

If *Book Review Digest*, xvi (1920), page 228, can be trusted, no one had the temerity to criticize adversely this lopsided *American Supplement*. Published in 1920, it was republished with a 26-page updating Appendix in 1928 (pp. 413-436). Eleven years later Otto Kinkeldey continued lauding the *American Supplement* as "an all-inclusive handbook" giving "carefully prepared, authentic information about musicians in America in a truly encyclopaedic manner." At last, Pratt had managed to create "a reference book which could hold its own with dictionaries of this kind produced in Europe." As if such praise were not enough, Kinkeldey continued: "Only those who know how scanty and elusive are our American musical historical documents and records, can realize the excellence of Pratt's effort to bring the available facts for the whole of our American development into a compact, reliable and orderly form, and can appreciate the quality of painstaking study and research which the joint authors bestowed upon this book."⁴⁰

Steeped as he was in European traditions, Kinkeldey praised Pratt for what now seems a hopelessly prim and white-collar choice of subject matter. At the very moment that Pratt was brief-listing "about 1700 persons" (900 of whom were native-born and 800 foreign born) in a chronological register, Esther Singleton was preparing for the Lavignac *Encyclopédie* a radically different, much more inclusive section on États-Unis (see below, pages 197-199). America for Pratt and Boyd meant the United States plus Ontario and Quebec.⁴¹ For them even the United States hardly existed west of the Mississippi River and south of the Mason-Dixon line. An 18-line article on Alice Fletcher and passing mention of "Princess Tsianina Redfeather" in the Cadman article cannot conceal their disinterest in American Indian expressions. They do include a brief, inconsequential article on the Fisk University Jubilee Singers, but otherwise betray complete innocence of Black musical life. Ragtime and jazz, or any of its practitioners do not soil their pages. Their articles with scarcely an exception lack any suitable bibliographies. They classify their biographees in two

⁴⁰Pratt began the Preface: "The project of this volume, when proposed by The Macmillan Company to the Editor whom they had selected, was finally taken up by him only with great hesitation, not because an American Supplement to the existing five volumes of Grove's famous *Dictionary of Music and Musicians* was not most desirable, but because of the inherent difficulties in the problem of making it satisfactory." He concludes his preface thus: "Inasmuch as the latest edition of *Grove's Dictionary* was issued ten to fifteen years ago, the publishers desired that this volume should include continuations of those articles that relate to the more conspicuous foreign musicians, as well as notices of some that for any reason were previously omitted. Accordingly, in the Dictionary proper will be found statements regarding more than a hundred musicians who are entirely outside the American field."

⁴¹Teresa Carreño and Jaime Nunó enter the *American Supplement* not because of their Latin American connections but because of their lengthy United States residences.



tiers. However, even their approximately 1700 names in the all-inclusive chronological Register falls 2000 short of the number of names that they themselves conceded to have won entries in "existing dictionaries." They fail to specify day and month for events, except births and deaths in the articles at pages 109-411.

The American Supplement, reissued in 1928 with an updating Appendix, accompanied the third edition. Before the fourth edition of *Grove* (1940)—edited as was the third (1927) by Colles, Percy Scholes (1877-1958) at the age of 61 entered the encyclopedia market with a one-volume *Oxford Companion to Music* (London, New York, Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1938) that grew from 1091 pages in the first edition to 1195 in the ninth (1955). Originally conceived as an "Everyone's Musical Encyclopedia," *The Oxford Companion*, first edition, carried five end pages advertising Scholes's (1) books on the history of music, (2) book on listening, and (3) books for children. An author comparable with David Ewen in the United States, Scholes at his prime kept busy "as many as six or more typists and co-workers including his devoted wife."⁴²

John Owen Ward, his successor in editing *The Oxford Companion* after his death, called Scholes's conscience "strongly protestant." The epitaph that he most desired was to have been, "The common people heard him gladly." There being more "common people" than scholars, he shrewdly calculated his monetary rewards for every publication venture. One "humble helper" who wrote his obituary commented that Scholes had a genius for making "one project help another."⁴³ In *Baker's Biographical Dictionary*, fifth edition (1958), Nicolas Slonimsky summarized his virtues: "A writer of great literary attainments and stylistic grace, he succeeded in presenting music 'appreciation' in a manner informative and stimulating to the layman and professional alike."

Nonetheless, every edition of Scholes's *Oxford Companion* published during his lifetime overflows with misleading generalities and oppressive mistakes. His failure to furnish formal bibliographies beyond *A List of Books about Music in the English language, prepared as an appendix to The Oxford Companion to Music* (Oxford University, 1940; 64 pp.) makes tracing down the sources of his errors an irritating and often tedious chore. Reviewing *The Oxford Companion* in *Saturday Review of Literature*, xix (December 24, 1938), page 18, Paul Henry Lang labeled Scholes's "injudicious use of material and lack of scholarly information" embarrassing. Even if "as a popular manual the book is commendable, it cannot be considered a reference volume for scholarly work," continued Lang. He also complained that Scholes contemptuously ignored "findings of musical historians and encyclopedists" far better informed than he.

Scholes visited the United States at least four times. As a result, "the American point of view is sympathetically and extensively represented."⁴⁴ Nonetheless, Stephen Collins Foster was not "a Southerner by descent"; *When Johnny comes marching home* was not composed by Patrick Gilmore, who in fact publicly disclaimed having composed it; neither Brindis (misspelled "Brindes") de Salas (erroneously called

⁴²John Owen Ward, "Scholes, Percy Alfred," *Dictionary of National Biography Supplement 1951-1960*, p. 866.

⁴³W. R. Anderson, Scholes obituary in *Musical Times*, xcix (September 1958), p. 501.

⁴⁴Douglas Moore, "Three Encyclopedias for Music Lovers," *New York Herald Tribune Books*, xv/16 (December 18, 1938), p. 5.



"court violinist to the Queen of Spain early in the nineteenth century") nor the Chevalier de Saint-Georges (still misspelled Saint-George at pp. 911 and 1070 as late as the ninth edition) should have been listed under "United States"; MacDowell did not "study" piano with Carreño (for whom there is no entry); Beach was not "the first composer in America to write a symphony of importance"; MacDowell's pupil H.F.B. Gilbert was not the "first composer of significance to recognize the possibilities for an American school of composition that lay in the use of negroid musical idioms" (unless Gottschalk be labelled an "insignificant" composer); Gottschalk's piano pieces do not "belong wholly to a past phase of musical taste" (unless Scholes's taste be equated with "musical taste"); categorizing the gospel hymn as "music unfortunately of the lowest class" again forces on the reader Scholes's value judgments. What Scholes says of the tune for the *Battle Hymn of the Republic* continues blatantly wrong from first through ninth editions.⁴⁵

Concerning Henry Clay Work's *Marching through Georgia* copyrighted by Root & Cady January 9, 1865, Scholes claims that General William Tecumseh Sherman "hated it"⁴⁶ despite Sherman's own testimony that whenever he heard it, even while abroad, "it was all I could do to keep my feet still."⁴⁷ At every public occasion, bands "struck up the air with which he is invariably greeted."⁴⁸ True, Sherman's *Memoirs* mention not *Marching through Georgia* but rather *Sherman's March to the Sea*⁴⁹ as his favorite song commemorating the march to Savannah. Written by a prisoner of war at Columbia, South Carolina, Samuel Hawkins Marshall Byers (1838-1933), who was freed when Sherman entered Columbia February 17, 1865,⁵⁰ this five-strophe song appealed more to Sherman for several reasons. For one, it was written by an officer who had spent four years in arduous campaign service. Sung first to a tune composed by Byers's fellow prisoner at Columbia, Lieutenant Albert J. Rockwell, Byers's song was sung March 3, 1865, at Cheraw, South Carolina, by General John A. Logan and other high ranking officers⁵¹ to the tune of *The Red, White, and Blue* (= *Columbia, the Gem of the Ocean*).⁵² When traced to its source (suppressed by Scholes)⁵³ Scholes's Sherman anecdote loses the very point that he tries making of

⁴⁵In the ninth edition he traces the tune to a "chantey" commissioned by a Charleston, South Carolina, fire-company from an unnamed Philadelphia composer in the late 1850's.

⁴⁶*Oxford Companion* (1938), p. 538; (1955), p. 605.

⁴⁷Thomas C. Fletcher, ed., *Life and Reminiscences of General Wm. T. Sherman by Distinguished men of his time. Ex-President Hayes, Gen. O.O. Howard, Hon. Geo. W. Childs [etc.]* ([New York]: Lennox Publishing Company, 1891), p. 108. In Dublin as early as 1872 *Marching Through Georgia* was regarded as "an old Irish air."

⁴⁸*Ibid.*, p. 307.

⁴⁹*Memoirs of Gen. W. T. Sherman written by himself*, 4th edn. (New Charles L. Webster & Co., 1891), II, 282-283.

⁵⁰*War of the Rebellion: A Compilation of the Official Records of the Union and Confederate Armies published under the direction of The Hon. Daniel S. Lamont, Secretary of War, Series I-Vol. XLVII, Part II-Correspondence, etc.* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1895), p. 796: "Lieut. S.H.M. Byers, Fifth Iowa Infantry, escaped prisoner, is detailed as bearer of dispatches."

⁵¹S.H.M. Byers, *With Fire and Sword* (New York: Neale Publishing Company, 1911), p. 182: "Here General Logan, who could play the violin, entertained them by singing my song of 'Sherman's Ride to the Sea,' accompanying his voice with the instrument. A dozen famous generals joined in the chorus."

⁵²*Ibid.*, p. 159. Byers called Lieutenant Rockwell's original "first music to which the song was ever sung . . . the best," but adds that Rockwell's setting was difficult. After their liberation from prison, the song was therefore usually sung to the familiar "air of 'The Red, White and Blue.'"

⁵³Concerning Scholes's suppression of parts of sources that disagreed with points that he wished making, see "'The Rivals'—Hawkins, Burney, and Boswell," *Musical Quarterly*, xxxv/1 (January 1950), p. 74.

it. Sherman's only partially quoted remarks during the three-day (August 13-15, 1890) 24th National Encampment of the Grand Army of the Republic reflect his irritation after twenty-five years at always being greeted anywhere and everywhere with the same song—as if his sole memorable deed had been Marching through Georgia. Henry Clay Work did not set both lyrics and tune “in type straight away” and *Marching through Georgia* was but one of his at least ten huge successes, ranging from *Kingdom Coming to Grandfather's Clock*. As late as the ninth edition Scholes unjustly labels the only authentic Georgian in *The Oxford Companion* an “idiot.” Scholes ignores Philip Paul Bliss (1838-1876), composer and lyricist of the Sherman-inspired song *Hold the Fort*.⁵⁴

In contrast with Scholes's United States misadventures traceable to suppressions, he omitted historically important Latin Americans for pure disinterest. Not only does he forgo any articles on Latin American nations, but he omits even so world famous a celebrity as Antônio Carlos Gomes and mentions Teresa Carreño (no first name) solely in his MacDowell article. So far as the Peninsula goes, he does not condescend to an article on Portugal or to mentioning any Portuguese composer (but does allot Denmark, Norway, Sweden, Iceland, and Finland lengthy individual treatments). His article on Spain leans heavily on Farmer for early phases; he mistakes the Palace Songbook for a *romancero*, labels Encina's plays as having “little intrinsic merit” and Encina's music as Flemish-influenced (elsewhere Scholes makes Juan Ponce composer of a *folia* “apparently for guitar, c. 1500”), confuses the two homonym Flechas, makes Morales a singer in the papal chapel during the 1520's (should be 1535-1545) and “director of the music” in the cathedral of Toledo in the 1530's (should be 1545-1547), and claims that Antonio Soler “wrote a famous book on the organ.” According to Scholes, Ramos de Pareja “discussed Equal Temperament,” the Valls controversy occurred “at the beginning of the seventeenth century,” Eximeno “anticipates Wagner's theories,” and “Vincente” Martín y Soler was once popular throughout Europe.

The ninth edition (1955) of *The Oxford Companion*, last to be published in Scholes's lifetime, boasts being “completely revised and reset.” The persistence of Spanish errors and of Portuguese and Latin American omissions through the ninth edition ironically defends Scholes. With that sure grasp of the buying public's interests that guaranteed his *Companion's* continued unrivalled commercial success, he rightly sensed that (like Gallio) his buying public “cared for none of these things”—preferring his profuse and undocumented chattiness on other matters to correct answers for “questions about words and names” that belong to Spanish- or Portuguese-speaking worlds.

To the year before the ninth edition of the best-selling *Oxford Companion* belongs the fifth edition of *Grove*. The nine-volume *Grove's Dictionary*, fifth edition (1954), advertised at \$127.50 for the set, was edited not by a Yorkshire protestant, vegetarian and opponent of bloody sports but by a linguist bent on defending English against Americanisms, Eric Blom (Bern, Switzerland, August 20, 1888; London, April 11, 1959). Like his predecessors Fuller Maitland and Colles, Blom enjoyed fame as a

⁵⁴See “*Hold the Fort*,” by P.P. Bliss, illustrated by Miss L.B. Humphrey and Robert Lewis (Boston: W.P. Gill and Co., 1877); Paul J. Scheips, *Hold the fort, the story of a song from the sawdust trail to the picket line* (Washington: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1971).



longtime newspaper critic. Forsaking the lame expedient of an American Supplement edited by a theological seminary professor, Blom returned to the much better plan of the unsegregated first edition. Nonetheless, his treatment of the United States won him few thanks on this other side of the water. Paul Henry Lang's Editorial in *Musical Quarterly*, xli/2 (April 1955), pages 215-222, included this paragraph:

Mr. Blom, the Editor, has a very powerful personality and a mind that is as clear as a bell. He writes with uncommon felicity and his logic is penetrating, that is, unless he is constrained to turn his attention to anything American; then it becomes colored with emotion, and the crisp and pleasant prose becomes sardonic, even bitter. A slight but persistent xenophobia can be found almost everywhere in the nine volumes. In the Preface it roars into a philippic and a declaration of preventive war on U.S. musicography; in articles by other authors a footnote or two may be used to splice it in. That this is almost entirely the Editor's doing is beyond doubt. Aside from the fact that one can recognize his turn of mind as readily as one does Chopin's, he expressly states in the Preface that "very little has escaped being touched up with [his] editorial green ink." If we add to this that although an uncommonly able writer, Mr. Blom is not fully at home in the byways of musicology, we must come to the conclusion that a good part of the failures of this Fifth Edition, but especially its crotchetyness, must be laid squarely upon his shoulders.

Richard S. Hill (1901-1961), who from 1951 to 1955 was president of the International Association of Music Libraries, added fuel to the flames in *Notes of the Music Library Association*, xii/1 (January 1954), pages 90-91. Although what Hill said of Blom's American (= United States) coverage has enough substance to merit quotation *in extenso*, fairness also decrees that Hill's own errors in so little space as his first paragraph be preliminarily itemized—if only to serve as warning that in the game played by Hill points can be scored as easily against him as against Blom.

(1) Thayer's sole "American subject" article among the 21 that he contributed to the first edition was the Lowell Mason article (ii, 225).

(2) William J. Henderson (1855-1935) contributed nothing to any edition of *Grove*. Hill confuses him with William Henderson, Scottish contributor to the first edition of articles on Edwin Ransford, Scheuerman, John Templeton (1802-1886), and David Kennedy (1825-1886), that survived into later editions. Hill's hot-tempered carelessness that betrayed him into confusing the famous American William J. Henderson with the little-known Scottish William Henderson born at Biggar, Lanarkshire, August 5, 1831, becomes the more embarrassing when in the "complete List of Contributors" printed at pages v-viii of *Grove*, second edition, last volume (1910), William Henderson is cited as already dead.

(3) Hill also should not have said that "by 1907 F.H. Jenks had made an appearance" when as a matter of fact Jenks had made an appearance in every volume of the first edition, 1879, 1880, 1883, 1889.

(4) Richard Aldrich's "eleven short articles in the first volume of *Grove V*" do not include the "ridiculous . . . 13 lines in which Geraldine Farrar [Melrose, Massachusetts, February 28, 1882; Ridgefield, Connecticut, March 11, 1967] are enshrined." Nevertheless such mistakes did not prevent Hill's review of Blom's American coverage from being widely hailed by every disappointed American excluded from "*Grove V*," or in any other way miffed with it.

A review in an American magazine must necessarily discuss the coverage given this country. The total picture is not a simple thing to describe, since like the rest of the Dictionary it is built up from the strata deposited by succeeding editions. The earliest contributor was Alexander



Wheelock Thayer, who goes back to the first edition and is still represented by a few articles, among them those on Lowell and William Mason H. F. Krehbiel and W. J. Henderson were the next to join the procession, and by 1907 Richard Aldrich and F. H. Jenks had made an appearance. Aldrich still has eleven short articles in the first volume of Grove V, most of them unrevised, including the ridiculous 13 lines accorded William Billings and the 13 lines in which Geraldine Farrar is enshrined. With the 3rd and 4th editions, the names become too numerous to list in full except to say that Warren Storey Smith, Nathan Broder, and Gustave Reese are still richly represented. The last two apparently set out to cover the more outstanding composers and writers for the Supplementary Volume of 1940, and although the continuing careers of their subjects have attracted more emendations than most of the earlier figures, the initials N. B. and G. R. are still met with often.

When it came time to collect new material, Mr. Blom chose a friend as his chief representative in this country, an Australian composer living in New York and writing for the *New York Herald Tribune*, Peggy Glanville-Hicks. She chose to do the composers herself, and the job she turned in strikes me as being both objective and thorough. In addition to revising a number of the earlier articles, she wrote many new ones (in the first volume are Bacon, Barber, Samuel and Wayne Barlow, Barrows, Bauer, Becker, Berger, Bergsma, Bernstein, Bingham, Bowles, Brant, and Brunswick). Performers she turned over to her colleague on the *Herald Tribune*, Francis D. Perkins. He revised the articles by Krehbiel and Kolodin on New York City, wrote a goodly number of articles on singers and conductors, but seems to have skimped on the instrumentalists, partly because so many of the big international artists had already been covered by others in earlier editions—Heifetz by Cobbett, Horowitz by Colles, and so forth. With the younger generation of musicologists the procedure appears to have been to send out blanks from London to be filled in by the respective candidates and returned. From the facts on these blanks, Martha Kingdon Ward, an English associate of Mr. Blom's, put together the articles. Although the coverage is fair enough (especially considering that some of the blanks would not be returned—as my own was not), the method is open to question on the grounds that Martha Ward knew none of the individuals she was asked to write up nor few of the institutions listed. Anyone who does know these things can easily rectify her slips, but a reading of the entries for Broder, Bukofzer, and Coopersmith will show what is meant. Surely the method is more suitable for an annual handbook than for a dictionary that prides itself on tone and is likely to stay in print for a decade or more.

These three are the main sources of new articles, but Mr. Blom had many others. He wrote quite a few himself—Emma Abbott, Ernest Bloch, George F. Bristow, and William Treat Upton can serve as examples—and he called on Karl Geiringer during the last stages to fill gaps with articles on Harold Spivacke, Ernst Toch, Louis Gruenberg, Olin Downes, Henry S. and Sophie H. Drinker, Philip Greeley Clapp, and others. George Pullen Jackson wrote articles on CHARACTER NOTATION (more familiar as "Shape Notes") and on SPIRITUALS, and the whole is heavily dotted with articles by Mr. Colles held over from earlier editions.

In short, considering the number of articles, it may seem like caviling to complain of the American coverage in Grove, but in that case I am forced to cavil. An Englishman wanting a balanced picture of the musical life in this country would be quite unable to get it. There is something completely hit-or-miss about the whole thing. One sees immediately that the intentions were admirable, but too much was left to chance and there was scarcely any attempt at centralized planning. There is clearly too much carried over from the early editions which the English editors have not known how or when to revise, and no American was allowed to do so. The only organization with an entry is the American Musicological Society, and that as was pointed out above is completely inadequate. A few orchestras in the East are treated in the articles on the cities that support them, but since there are no articles on any city west of Chicago, all Western musical organizations are passed over in silence. Smaller instrumental ensembles even in the East are left out almost entirely, and the country boasts no string



quartets—even the Budapest Quartet, which managed to make the 1940 Supplementary Volume, has now been dropped.

Mr. Blom would probably react to this by saying that if we want such detailed coverage, then we must publish our own dictionary—and undoubtedly that is just what we must do.

Not only did Richard Hill fail of biographical mention in the fifth edition, but also his name is absent from the list of approximately 450 contributors (pages xix–xxviii of volume I). Nathan Broder, Irving Kolodin, Gustave Reese, Charles Seeger, and Carleton Sprague Smith contributed articles—but not Hill. Charles Rosen in his trenchant review of *The New Grove*⁵⁵ divides reviewers into three classes: contributors, persons invited to contribute whose contributions were rejected, and those not invited. The resentment of the third group—those not invited—runs deepest according to Rosen. Without a biographical entry and minus any contributions, Hill had every reason for writing an acerbic review of the fifth edition. As a belated *amende honorable*, Alec Hyatt King's article on Hill in *The New Grove*, VIII, 559–560, categorizes his reputation as already in the 1950's "so great that when the International Association of Music Libraries elected its first president in 1951, he was the obvious choice for this office, which he held until 1955." But these kind words came too late. Hill died February 7, 1961.

Whose biography has been omitted from *The New Grove*, who has been invited to contribute but his/her contribution paid for and then declined, who has not been invited to contribute? If Rosen may be believed, *The New Grove* reeks with minor musicologists: "There are far too many . . . every minor musicologist receives a relatively full bibliography of his articles and books."⁵⁶ Nonetheless, numerous front-ranking authorities whose speciality has been the United States lack an entry of any sort. Witness these thirteen omissions sampled through the first half of the alphabet: Allen P(erdue) Britton⁵⁷ (*Directory of American Scholars*, sixth edition; *Who's Who in America*, 38th through 41st editions), Raoul Camus (*Contemporary Authors*, LXV [1977]), Richard Crawford (*Who's Who in America*, 41st edition, I, 745),⁵⁸ Ralph Daniel (author of the article "Music, Western" in the *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, *Macropaedia*, XII, 704–715, and profiled in *Contemporary Authors*, LIII [1975], 134–135), Dena Epstein (*Who's Who in America*, 40th and 41st editions), Harry L(ee) Eskew (*Dictionary of American Scholars*, sixth edition), Harold Gleason (*Baker's*, sixth edition), Maurice Hinson (*Contemporary Authors*, XLV [1974]), Richard H. Jackson, H[arold] Earle Johnson (*Riemann Ergänzungsband*, 1972, 595–596),

⁵⁵"The Musicological Marvel," *New York Review of Books*, xxviii/9 (May 28, 1981), pp. 26–27, 30–36.

⁵⁶*Ibid.*, p. 26.

⁵⁷The former dean of Indiana University School of Music, Wilfred Bain, earns a biographical entry (*The New Grove* II, 38–39). However, the United States consultant seemingly disparages music educators = educationists. Even such front runners as Karl Gehrrens (in *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*) and Peter Dykema (in *Baker's*, sixth edition) are omitted. Concerning the latter, see "The Unknown Peter Dykema," *Music Educators Journal* xxxviii (June–July 1951), pp. 11–12.

For an example of the short shrift given music education throughout *The New Grove*, see two articles by the same author—one on "American Musicological Society" replete with names of founders, number of members and institutions, exact titles of monographs; the other on "Music Educators National Conference" devoid of any corresponding data. AMS's 2600 members are specified, but not MENC's 68,000.

⁵⁸Among others omitted: David Crawford, distinguished Renaissance scholar named chairman of musicology at the University of Michigan in 1978 and profiled in *Who's Who in America*, 41st edition, I, 744; no less renowned Glenn Elson Watkins, 39th through 41st editions of *Who's Who in America*.



Lester S(tern) Levy (*Contemporary Authors*, xiv (1976)),⁵⁹ Robert Guy McCutchan (*Baker's*, sixth edition), Frank J(ohnson) Metcalf (*Baker's Biographical Dictionary*, sixth edition). Ethnomusicologists profiled in *The New Grove* include Nicolas England, Alan Merriam, and Bruno Nettl, but not Laura Boulton, Joseph Hickerson, David Park McAllester, and Richard Waterman.⁶⁰ Even more astonishingly, J.H. Kwabena Nketia's biography is omitted. To come to music critics: why biographical entries for Alfred Frankenstein and Harold Schonberg but none for Martin Bernheimer, Paul Hume, and Irving Kolodin?⁶¹

Kolodin claimed that *The New Grove* slights "composers of popular importance." True, Jerome Kern, Cole Porter, Richard Rodgers, and Stephen Sondheim enter; but not Ferde Grofé (in *MGG*), Charles K. Harris (*After the Ball*), Mildred J. Hill (*Happy Birthday to You*), Carrie Jacobs-Bond⁶² (*I Love You Truly, A Perfect Day*), Liliuokalani (*Aloha Oe*), Albert Hay Malotte (*The Lord's Prayer*), Lewis Redner (*O Little Town of Bethlehem*), Oley Speaks (*On the Road to Mandalay, Sylvia*), Samuel Ward (*America the Beautiful*), and Richard Storrs Willis (*It Came Upon a Midnight Clear*).

Apart from women composers of universally known secular songs, numerous United States women notable in other musical spheres fail of biographical coverage in *The New Grove*. To list a sample baker's dozen: Pauline Alderman,⁶³ Radie Britain, Fannie Dillon, Octavia Hensel (= Mary Alice Seymour), Phoebe Palmer Knapp, Mana-Zucca = Augusta Zuckermann, Mary Carr Moore, Joan Peyser, Lilla Belle Pitts, Esther Singleton,⁶⁴ Gladys Tipton,⁶⁵ Elizabeth Waldo, and Elinor Remick Warren are omitted. (Thanks to Eileen Southern, Julia Perry gains entry.)

Despite being covered much more thoroughly than women, male contemporaries whose various activities in the United States signal them for *New Grove* biographical entry range from Theo Alcantara, Stephen Douglas Burton,⁶⁶ Tito Capobianco, Richard Dirksen, David Guion, Albert Austin Harding,⁶⁷ David Kraehenbuehl,

⁵⁹James J. Fuld earns an entry, *The New Grove*, vii, 25-26.

⁶⁰McAllester, Nketia, and Waterman enter *Riemann Ergänzungsband*, 1975, at pp. 160, 279-280, 881. Other United States ethnomusicological candidates for future entry: Robert Garfias, Arthur LaBrew, Elizabeth May, Dale Olsen, Daniel Sheehy.

⁶¹In "An Overgrown Grove," *Saturday Review*, viii/1 (January 1981), pp. 87-88, Kolodin breathed heavily on the 22,500 articles containing 18,000,000 words in *The New Grove*: "Many weeks' perusal of the volumes manifests an insistent thoroughness of treatment of composers of scholarly rather than popular, importance. If you are interested in Gilles de Bins dit Binchois of the 15th century, you'll find a dozen pages on him. If, however, you are interested in the great, beloved Spanish composer Isaac Albéniz, you'll have to look elsewhere for embracing discussion."

⁶²*The New Grove* profiles Guy d'Hardelot = composer of *Because*.

⁶³*Directory of American Scholars*, sixth edition, and *Who's Who of American Women*, first through third editions, included her. *Festival Essays for Pauline Alderman*, ed. Burton L. Karson (Provo: Brigham Young University Press, 1976) contained 17 valuable articles by her students and colleagues.

⁶⁴*Baker's*, sixth edition, includes Britain, Dillon, Knapp, Moore, Mana-Zucca, Peyser, and Singleton.

⁶⁵*Who's Who of American Women*, first, second, and fifth editions (1958-59, 1961-62, 1968-69).

⁶⁶Burton's credentials include articles on the Wolf Trap (Vienna, Virginia) premiere of his opera *The Duchess of Malfi* inventoried in *The Music Index*, xxx/8, 9, 11, 12 (August, September, November, December, 1978), xxxi/1 (January 1979), on his bicentennially commissioned Symphony No. 2 "Ariel" listed in *The Music Index*, xxix/1, 2 (January, February, 1977), on his piano trio (xxix/6, 9 [June, September, 1977]), and on his orchestral Fanfare (xxix/11, 12 [November, December, 1977]). *Time* magazine carried an article on him September 4, 1978, p. 80.

⁶⁷Alcantara and Capobianco are profiled in *Who's Who in America*, 41st edition. *Baker's*, sixth edition, profiles Guion, Harding, and Revelli.

Apart from Guion, another Texas biographee in *ASCAP Biographical Dictionary* who continues frequently performed is Oscar J. Fox (1879-1961).



Douglas Leedy,⁶⁸ Austin Lovelace, Lloyd Pfautsch,⁶⁹ Richard Purvis, Buryl Red, William D. Revelli, and William Jensen Reynolds to Carlton Raymond Young. Why does *The New Grove* omit the "distinguished pianist and conductor" Rudolph Ganz, to whom *Baker's*, sixth edition, attributes a long list of compositions (including a piano concerto premiered with the Chicago Symphony February 20, 1941)? Another deceased Chicagoan unjustly excluded is Arne Oldberg (profiled in *Baker's*, sixth edition, and *Riemann* [see 1975 *Ergänzungsband*]).

Where to draw the line so far as historic composers go can be endlessly argued. But Jacob Eckhard, Giovanni (John) Gualdo, Giovanni (John) Palma, Henry Purcell (1742-1802), Jervis Henry Stevens, and Peter Valton⁷⁰ are but eighteenth-century earners of a long list of omitted foreign-born composers whose claims to biographies are supported by important publications. Among early native-born composers in *The New Grove*, New England singing masters predominate. But apart from Billings, Holden, and Read, the rule for these is no more than date and place of birth and death, with cross-reference (no bibliography) to the Psalmody article (xv, 345-347), with only a short generalized bibliography. Among singing masters fanning West and South after 1800, Cardon and Davisson earn brief entries, but not the Chapins profiled by Charles Hamm,⁷¹ Elkanah Kelsay Dare,⁷² nor William Moore.⁷³ Bald brief-listing without individualized bibliography belies the worldwide importance of William Batchelder Bradbury, Philip Paul Bliss, Charles Hutchinson Gabriel, and others of their stamp.

The allotment of six columns to Anthony Philip Heinrich and of less than two to Stephen Collins Foster prefigures the relative space awarded their twentieth-century successors. The approximate number of columns occupied by composers in the following line-up tells its own tale: Ives 29, Copland 14, Cage 11, Elliott Carter 10, Cowell 9, Sessions 7, Virgil Thomson 6, Babbitt 5, Barber 5, Roy Harris 5, Ned Rorem 3, Leonard Bernstein 2, David Diamond 2, George Rochberg 2, George Crumb 1, Jacob Druckman 1, Ezra Laderman 1, Terry Riley 1. Howard Hanson rates a 57-line article plus a 27-line works list; La Monte Young, on the other hand, earns a 64-line article with a 20-line works list. Hanson's bibliography consists of four titles, Young's of six titles.

As for Blacks: Armstrong, Basie, Bechet, and Ellington rate 4 columns, 2, 2, and 4. Ulysses Kay rates 48 lines (plus lengthy works list and bibliography), Thomas A. Dorsey gets 47 lines, Scott Joplin and Bessie Smith each merit 46 lines, Mahalia

⁶⁸Joseph and Vivian Kerman included a section on this Berkeley-trained composer in *Listen*, first edition (New York: Worth, 1972), withdrawn in second and third editions (1976, 1980).

⁶⁹Biographies of Lovelace, Pfautsch, and Young in Emory Stevens Bucke, ed., *Companion to the Hymnal* (Nashville/New York: Abingdon Press, 1970), pp. 599-600, 639, 718-719.

⁷⁰Biographies of Eckhard and the last three in George W. Williams, ed., *Jacob Eckhard's Choirmaster Book of 1809: A Facsimile with introduction and notes* (Columbia, South Carolina: University of South Carolina Press, 1971), pp. xi-xvi and 106-107. Eighteenth-century German-speaking immigrants profiled in *The New Grove*: Beissel (see below, p. 182), Herbst, Kelpius, Peter. Nineteenth-century: Heinrich, Thomas, Timm, but not Daniel Schlesinger, William Scharfenberg, or Hermann Wollenhaupt.

⁷¹"The Chapins and Sacred Music in the South and West," *Journal of Research in Music Education*, viii/2 (1960), 91-98.

⁷²See indexed references in *Protestant Church Music in America* (New York: W.W. Norton, 1966). In July 1820 Dare "of Lancaster county, Pennsylvania," published a sermon that is his only independent publication listed in the *National Union Catalog*.

⁷³Moore's *Columbian Harmony* (Cincinnati: Morgan, Lodge and Fisher for the author, 1825) discussed in Gilbert Chase, *America's music* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1955), p. 193; James P. Carrell and William Caldwell brief-listed in *The New Grove* are discussed in *America's music*, pp. 192-194.



Jackson gets 29 (plus bibliography), W.C. Handy 29, Henry Lewis 26, Eileen Southern 26 (plus bibliography), James Cleveland 22, Clarence Cameron White 22, Marian Anderson 20, Sarah Vaughan 16, Roland Hayes 15, Harry Lawrence Freeman 14, Thomas Bethune 12, George Walker 11. The Work family (three members) rates more than a column. Barès, Dédé, and Snaer fail of mention. Nor do Aretha Franklin, Isaac Hayes, Diana Ross, Donna Summer, or Stevie Wonder garner biographies.

As a rule, the longer articles deserve more accolades than the shorter. Charles Rosen rightly called Bayan Northcott's profuse article on Elliott Carter excellent but the much shorter Roger Sessions article "inadequate—indeed, incredibly so, and it took two authors to produce this mouse."⁷⁴ Rosen labelled the two-column Leonard Bernstein entry "equally unsatisfactory, with no real assessment of his achievement as composer, conductor, and educator." The same rule that longer articles are usually more accurate and better written applies equally to Americans flourishing between 1890 and 1920. Margery Morgan Lowens's insightful eight columns on MacDowell and William Kearns's seven columns on Horatio Parker contrast with Gustave Reese's miserable 18-line article⁷⁵ on David Stanley Smith that disgraces the memories of both. Southall's meager dozen lines on Bethune lacking a works list discredits Blind Tom.

Another entry requiring drastic overhaul before reuse in any contemplated "Americogrove" (*The New Grove Dictionary of Music in the United States*, H. Wiley Hitchcock, co-editor) is the article by David Campbell of Brooklyn College on Charles Wakefield Cadman (1881–1946). To specify errors: Samuel Wakefield (1799–1895) was the composer's great-grandfather, not grandfather. Cadman was accompanist of the Pittsburgh Male Chorus, not conductor. He was organist of the East Liberty Presbyterian Church in Pittsburgh 1907 to 1910 and not in 1908 "organist at the United Presbyterian Church in Homestead, Pennsylvania." Cadman's *Four American Indian Songs* were published in January 1909 before his visit to the Omaha and Winnebago reservations, not after. His librettist and lyricist was not Nellie, but Nelle Richmond Eberhart (*née* Eleanor Ethel McCurdy). Her dates, 1871–1944, not given in the article, make her ten years Cadman's senior.

Cadman's million-seller *At Dawning*, Opus 29, No. 1, was published in 1906, not 1909 (first column) and is not an item in *Four American Indian Songs*, Opus 45. Cadman gave his first American Indian Music-Talk February 9, 1909, not in 1910. He did not meet so-called Princess Tsianina Redfeather [Blackstone] until 1913. She was a Cherokee-Creek, not an Omaha Indian and not a descendant of the Shawnee Tecumseh (1768–1813). She first assisted Cadman in his American Indian Music-Talk April 24, 1913. After several Southern California visits Cadman moved to Los Angeles in January 1916, not 1917. The University of Southern California gave him his honorary doctorate in 1926, not 1924. The third Indianist composer mentioned in the last paragraph of the article was not Niven, but Arthur Nevin, younger brother of Ethelbert Nevin (mistakes mar articles on them also).

In Cadman's works list, *Land of Misty Water* (= *Daoma*) and *Ramala* are all the same opera, with revisions, and should not be listed as different works. Four published stage works are omitted. *The Willow Tree* was premiered October 3, 1932, not November 3, 1933. He composed and published the *Carnegie Library March* in 1898,

⁷⁴*New York Review of Books*, May 28, 1981, p. 33.

⁷⁵In Reese's shameful article carried over from *Grove's* fifth edition, only Smith's erroneous death date (by nine years) and wrong works list are corrected. Intervening important bibliography fails of listing (see below, pp. 221–226) and Smith's career stops at 1920, 29 years before his death.



not 1894. He never composed any String Quartet, although Campbell lists such with the date 1917. His Violin Sonata was published in 1932, not 1937. His Piano Quintette is dated 1937. *Sayonara* was published in 1910, not 1913. The Bibliography fails to list Cadman's own 31-page catalogue of his works printed in 1937, omits Harry D. Perison's "Charles Wakefield Cadman: His Life and Works," and instead lists merely three out-of-date misinformed articles—the most recent of which was published twenty-two years before Cadman's death.

Russell P. Getz's article on Beissel takes no account of the two-installment article by Oskar Kilian of Eberbach, Germany, in *Bach*, vii/3 and 4 (July and October, 1976), 25–28 and 31–36—translated from "Konrad Beisel (1691–1768): Gründer des Klosters Ephrata in Pennsylvanien," *Eberbacher Geschichtsblatt*, July, 1957. Relying on contemporary Eberbach documents, Kilian dates Beissel's birth March 1, 1691 (not 1690) and cites Georg (not Johann) as the first of Beissel's baptismal names.

Not only are the longer articles on American composers usually better in quality than the shorter, but also the longer on musicologists exceed qualitatively. Howard Mayer Brown's longer article on Lowinsky does his towering retired Chicago colleague better justice than his own shorter John Milton Ward article that fails to mention "Le problème des hauteurs dans la musique pour luth et vihuela au XVI^e siècle" (*Le Luth et sa musique* [Paris, 1958]), "The Lute Music of MS Royal Appendix 58," *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, xiii/3 (1960), 117–125, and "Spanish Musicians in Sixteenth-Century England" (*Essays in Musicology in honour of Dragan Plamenac* [1969]). The Editor-in-Chief's 64 lines on the versatile Charles Rosen leave Paula Morgan's 33 on the versatile Nicolas Slonimsky completely in the shade (she misspells *Encyclopaedia Britannica*). To accentuate the difference, *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart* awards Slonimsky a dense fact-filled 72 lines (plus 38 devoted to *Werke* and 8 to *Literatur*). Any of the Ivy League musicologists earns a better entry than Irving Lowens's 20-line biography accompanied by a grossly incorrect and incomplete list of writings. The Howard Chandler Robbins Landon unsatisfactory biography ends with a cavil by an author who mistakes regis for Regents.

City articles are always the hardest to write well. Charles Rosen's major criticisms included the "articles on Vienna, New York, [and] Paris which seem to have been written by Chambers of Commerce." The length of the United States city articles ranges downward from the 36 columns on New York and 12 on Boston through Philadelphia (8), New Orleans (7), Chicago (6), Cincinnati (4), St. Louis, San Francisco, and Los Angeles (3 each), Atlanta, Baltimore, Charleston, South Carolina, Denver, Minneapolis and St. Paul, and Rochester, New York (2 each) to Dallas, Houston, and Seattle (1). Neither of the Portlands (Maine or Oregon) enjoys an entry; nor does Salt Lake City. Several prime Southern candidates (Louisville, Memphis, Mobile, Nashville, Richmond, San Antonio, and Savannah) lack entries. The Boston article ranks certainly among the best. Not everyone will class [Alexandre] Tansman as an American (iii, 83a, line 54), or credit [Otto] Kinkeldey with having been one of the "introducers of musicology at Harvard in the 1930's" (85b, line 51), or admit that [John Sullivan] Dwight was *Boston Transcript* critic from the 1860's to 1881.⁷⁶ But the accuracy and balance of the article as a whole are exceptional.

⁷⁶*Dictionary of American Biography*, iii/1, p. 568, credits him with only six months' *Transcript* service ("in 1890, for six months [Dwight] substituted for W.F. Apthorp as musical editor of the *Boston Transcript*").

Otto E. Albrecht, writer of the "Philadelphia" article in both *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart* and *The New Grove*, corrects such questionable statements in his 1962 *MGG* article as "Julius Falckner schrieb eine Reihe von Kirchenliedmelodien" and "Benjamin Franklin (ein ihm zugeschriebenes StrQu., hrsg. von G. de Van, Paris 1946)"; but repeats uncomfortably large blocs.⁷⁷ In both *MGG* and *New Grove* Albrecht consistently emphasizes local first performances of famous works already given their absolute premieres elsewhere. Not for him "Giovanni Gualdo, a musician and wine merchant, who in 1769 placed an advertisement in *The Pennsylvania Gazette* for a concert devoted to the performances of his own works, probably the first such concert in the colonies."⁷⁸ In the forepart of the eighteenth century Blacks came into their own. Samuel Breck's diary mentions under date of February 15, 1828, a ball at the "prettiest" house in Philadelphia, Dr. James Rush's home on Chestnut Street.

[Francis = Frank] Johnson: This *Black* musician is a man of taste, and even science in his vocation. He has organized a large band, and gives lessons upon various instruments; and what is still more useful and certainly more singular is the talent that he has of turning every lively tune in the new operas to his purpose by adapting to it a Quadrille or Cotillion of his own composing which he introduces at the parties in Philadelphia, and then gets engraved and circulated through the union; thus becoming the author of all novelty in dancing.⁷⁹

Two decades later the *New York Tribune* (of December 29, 1848) carried an article on Philadelphia's Black population, stressing music and dancing at the Astor House and elsewhere on "Baker, Small and Mary-streets."

They dance as if there never was any more dancing to be gotten on earth and as if it were even doubtful whether any so good as this would be found anywhere else. One thing will be uniformly observed in these assemblages, almost every person on the floor invariably keeps good time with the music, and everything comes out as regularly as a dance or a fight in a well-drilled melodrama. The African has an intense instinct for music and time.⁸⁰

Next, the *New York Tribune* reporter speculates on a roseate future when African "singers, instrumentalists and dancers of a higher order than have ever yet been seen or heard" will be Africans' contribution to the performing arts. "The abstract love for the beautiful is much stronger and more universal with the African than any white race, except the modern Italians and the ancient Grecians."

Any article on Philadelphia to be representative ought to mention not only Johnson but also the Blacks surrounding him who published sheet music, who conducted bands, and who dominated local music-making at entertainments given by both rich and poor, Black and white.⁸¹ Richard Milburn, a street Black, gave the native Philadelphian Septimus Winner the melody for one of the most successful popular songs in American history, *Listen to the Mockingbird* (1855). Albrecht lists every inconse-

⁷⁷*MGG*, x, columns 1185-1188a = *The New Grove*, xiv, 622b-623a. The sections on Educational Institutions and on Music Publishing contain new material.

⁷⁸"Music in Colonial Philadelphia," in *Pennsylvania 1776* (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1976), p. 259.

⁷⁹"The Diary of Samuel Breck, 1827-1833," *The Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography*, ciii/2 (April 1979), p. 225.

⁸⁰George Rogers Taylor, ed., "'Philadelphia in Slices' by George G. Foster," *The Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography*, xciii/1 (January 1969), p. 63.

⁸¹*Ibid.*, p. 40: "In the dancing-room up-stairs, the old Negro fiddler has taken his seat. . . . And now the old fiddle strikes up 'Cooney in de holler.'" The reporter here describes Saturday night dancing at Dandy Hall catering to the poorest whites.



quential European opera's first Philadelphia performance but balks at mentioning even white local composers or vast popular successes, such as Winner, Redner, and Malotte.

Among other city articles, those on Baltimore, Cincinnati,⁸² Cleveland, Dallas, Houston, Los Angeles, St. Louis, and San Francisco unite with Philadelphia in ignoring any contributions by Blacks (or any other minorities). Even such city articles as do mention Blacks—Chicago, Kansas City, and New Orleans—confine themselves to jazz.⁸³ Despite Mahalia Jackson, Thomas A. Dorsey, and Roberta Martin, the Chicago article ignores all Black gospel, as well as Black classicists; and, as for whites, decrees that "few composers of serious music have been trained or have worked for any significant period in Chicago." But what of such a motley array as Philip Paul Bliss, Anthony Donato, Rudolph Ganz, Frederick Grant Gleason, Leopold Godowsky,⁸⁴ Robert Goldbeck, Peter Lutkin, Arne Oldberg, Silas Pratt, W.C.E. Seeboeck, Leo Sowerby, and Alan Stout? The article fails to mention any of Chicago's prime periodicals of the last century culminating in *Music*⁸⁵ (1891/2-1902). Among "writers on music" it signals only George P. Upton. Far more important from every United States standpoint was W.S.B. Mathews.

The yearning to validate local musical developments constantly in terms of expensive imports from Europe and reveling in costly buildings play havoc with both the Los Angeles⁸⁶ and San Francisco articles. Neither author accurately reports nineteenth-century local music history, neither shows any command of the abundant source material, neither shows any knowledge of local Spanish-language music traditions.⁸⁷ Inadequate and dated as are the articles on "Indiana University School of Music," "Michigan, University of, School of Music," and "Northwestern University School of Music," even those three articles exceed the coverage of the Eastman School—relegated to a sixteen-line paragraph in the negligible city article on "Rochester."⁸⁸

⁸²James Monroe Trotter gained his musical training at Cincinnati. See *The New Grove*, xix, 188, and "America's First Black Music Historian," *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, xxvi/3 (1973), 383-404.

⁸³The "Detroit" article gives Blacks one sentence: "The Motown Record Corporation, begun in the early 1960s, has promoted a large number of performing artists and has dominated the field of black American popular music."

⁸⁴Godowsky, who took American citizenship in 1891, spent the 1890-1900 decade based at Chicago.

⁸⁵*Music*, edited by W.S.B. Mathews, enters *The New Grove* surpassingly fine article on "Periodicals," xiv, 438 (no. 236).

⁸⁶Willson is misspelled, xi, 245a; cf. *The New Grove*, xx, 442b. The Walt Disney-endowed California Institute of the Arts was "incorporated in 1961 as the first fully accredited, degree-granting institution in the United States designed exclusively for students in all the visual and performing arts" (absorbed Los Angeles Conservatory founded in 1883). The article mentions none of the California State University campuses.

⁸⁷As early as December 17 and 23, 1865, the touring Castillo Company gave Los Angeles its first Verdi with Act I of *Attila*. Teresa Carreño made her Los Angeles debut at the Turnverein June 25, 1875. Grand Opera House, which opened in 1884 at Second and Main Streets, hosted on January 23, 1886, the touring Orquesta Típica Mexicana. The Alcaraz Grand Spanish Opera Company (60 artists) spent the week of August 15-20, 1892, at the Los Angeles Grand Opera House, where the company offered zarzuelas by the best-known Spaniards of the day: Ruperto Chapi's three-act *La Tempestad*, Francisco Asenjo Barbieri's *El proceso del Can-Can* (with libretto by Rafael María Liern y Cerach), and Federico Chueca's *La Gran Vía*.

⁸⁸Blacks go unmentioned, despite the pathbreaking Eastman School Ph.D. dissertation (1973) by Horace Clarence Boyer, "An Analysis of Black Church Music with Examples drawn from Services in Rochester, New York." See *Dissertation Abstracts International*, vol. 34, no. 2 (August 1973), 804-A, 805-A.



"Juilliard School of Music. New York conservatory founded in 1905 and known as the Institute of Musical Art until 1923" (*The New Grove*, ix, 746a, eked out by xiii, 186b) traduces history. As *MGG*, xvi, 889, correctly states: Augustus D. Juilliard who died April 25, 1919, left approximately \$12,000,000 for music education causes. In 1924 most of this sum became endowment of the newly founded Juilliard Graduate School, located until 1931 at 49 East 52nd Street, and thereafter until 1969 at 130 Claremont Avenue. Not until 1945 did Juilliard amalgamate with the next-door Institute of Musical Art at 120 Claremont Avenue. Although Boris Schwarz's articles on both Jascha Heifetz and Gregor Piatigorsky specify their lengthy teaching appointments at the University of Southern California School of Music, *The New Grove* merely cross-references the latter school to "Los Angeles," xi, 244b; seven lines compress its history from founding to the 1970's. Contrary to *The New Grove*, the renowned Communist composer Hanns Eisler never held a teaching post at the University of Southern California School of Music.

To leave city and school of music articles and come to subject articles: the 36-column article on jazz by Max Harrison, the 12-column on blues by Paul Oliver, and six on ragtime by William Bolcom properly emphasize Blacks in both iconography and text. Paul Oliver also contributes the seven columns on Black gospel and six on Negro spirituals. All three authors are white. Thus once again, the rule is proved. Black authors (such as Southern and Southall in *The New Grove*) may be entrusted with articles on Black subjects, but only when the topics lack commercial significance.

Rock celebrities fare poorly in *The New Grove*. Charles Hamm's sections on Rock and Roll and Rock (xv, 111-119) substitute for any in-depth coverage of individuals or groups.⁸⁹ Apart from the United States, Brazil is the other Western Hemisphere nation boasting the most widely influential urban music stars. Despite intensive coverage of Argentine, Brazilian, and Mexican "folk musics" (i, 566-571, 14 musical examples; iii, 223-243, 36 musical examples; xii, 229-240, 5 examples), *The New Grove* lacks any article on popular musics of Latin America that deals with developments later than the 1960's. What is said (x, 529-534) skims the surface. Not to *The New Grove* but to the *Enciclopedia de México*, xii, 631-632, must one turn for information on Consuelo Velázquez, composer of *Bésame mucho* recorded by the Beatles at Hamburg in 1962. Among recorded Brazilian luminaries Chico Buarque de Hollanda heads a list so heterogeneous as Jorge Ben, Maria Betânia, Elisete Cardoso, Gal Costa, Rita Lee, Sergio Mendes, Milton Nascimento, Jair Rodrigues, Wilson Simonal, Elza Soares, Agnaldo Timóteo, and Caetano Veloso, whose data must be sought in the *Enciclopédia da música brasileira erudita folclórica e popular* (São Paulo: Art Editora, 1977), rather than in *The New Grove*.⁹⁰

⁸⁹Henry Pleasants's 19-line article on Elvis Presley compares unfavorably with the 62 lines in *Riemann Ergänzungsband L-Z* (1975), 413. Deane L. Root's 41 lines on Bob Dylan do better, but still lacks the discography that *Reimann* (1972), 305, provided to 1970. Charles Rosen mightily argued for discographies (*New York Review of Books*, May 28, 1981, p. 26).

⁹⁰Roberto Carlos (*Enciclopédia da música brasileira*, ii, 662-663) rates one sentence in *The New Grove*. The *jovem guarda* movement in which he participated "provided Brazilian popular music with new stylistic currents and a dynamic vitalization that brought about highly sophisticated groups such as the Tropicália," according to *The New Grove*, x, 534. But *Enciclopédia da música brasileira*, i, 388, reports that Tropicália lasted only two years, 1967 to the beginning of 1969, after which it completely died out.



Avant-garde Argentine and Brazilian composers fare exceptionally well in *The New Grove*. Juan Carlos Paz rates a 74-line laudatory article followed by a 34-line works list. On the other hand, Roberto Caamaño by the same author rates a mere 47-line article, plus 14-line works list. The different treatment can be further inferred from this sample quotation: "Caamaño's compositions are quite conventional, without trace either of nationalism or of novel techniques." To cite other favors bestowed on vanguardists: Mauricio Kagel (classed as an Argentine in *The New Grove*) emerges with 205 lines and a longer works list and bibliography than even Alberto Ginastera's. (Gilbert Chase, author of the article on Ginastera reaching 307 lines, makes no attempt at a complete works list to the date of writing.⁹¹) But the more traditionally minded Carlos Guastavino, although important enough for an entry in *Grove's*, 5th edition, and in recent volumes of *Riemann*, rates nothing. Ariel Ramírez,⁹² now universally known for his *Misa Criolla* and *Navidad nuestra* that have won Orff-like popularity, lacks an entry. Nor does the repetitious Latin American popular music article pick up their names.⁹³ True, the latter article (as well as the tango article) does mention so much of a popular idol as Carlos Gardel. But how is the novice to find him or any other popular celebrities without cross-references?

The New Grove omits numerous Argentine musicographers: Ernesto Epstein, Juan Pedro Franze, Guillermo Furlong Cardiff, Carmen García Muñoz, Vicente Gesualdo, Waldemar Axel Roldán, Pola Suárez Urtubey, by way of example. Elsewhere, musicologists Ayestarán (Uruguay), Diniz (Brazil), Claro, Pereira Salas, Salas Viu, Urrutia Blondel (Chile), and Vega (Argentina), rightfully enjoy entries. Why not Cleofe Person de Mattos and Mercedes Reis Pequeno (Brazil), Luis Merino and Magdalena Vicuña Lyon (Chile), Pablo Hernández Balaguer (Cuba, 1928-1966). Esperanza Pulido Silva (Mexico), Rhazes Hernández López (Venezuela)?

As for choice of contemporary composers from nations further down the alphabet: why Gabriel Brnčić of Chile, but not Miguel Aguilar Ahumada, Carlos Botto, Fernando García, Miguel Letelier Valdés, Pedro Núñez Navarrete, Sergio Ortega, David Serendero, found in *Riemann*? Jacqueline Nova from Colombia, Juan Blanco from Cuba, Enrique de Marchena Dujarric and Juan Francisco García from the Domini-

⁹¹To the works listed by Chase, *Compositores de las Américas*, 1 (Washington: Union Panamericana, 1955), pp. 33-34, adds *Impresiones de la puna* (Para flauta y cuarteto de cuerdas), 1934, and *Sinfonía elegiaca*, 1944. *Baker's*, fifth edition (1958), p. 565, adds *Sinfonía porteña* premiered at Buenos Aires May 12, 1942, and *Concierto Argentino* at Montevideo July 18, 1941. *Baker's*, sixth edition (1978), specifies the premiere of Ginastera's *Sinfonía elegiaca* at Buenos Aires May 31, 1946. Chase's eight-item Bibliography stopping at 1973 contrasts with the twelve-item Ginastera Bibliography in *Riemann Ergänzungsband Personenteil A-K* (1972). A large and important Ginastera bibliography easily traceable through *The Music Index* has accumulated since Chase's 1973 cutoff date.

⁹²*Sohlmans Musiklexikon*, v (Stockholm: Sohlmans Förlag AB, 1979), p. 148.

⁹³In *The New Grove*, x, 533a, last paragraph, and xviii, 564b, middle paragraph, the author of the article on Latin American popular music and of the tango article repeats himself. Sample repeats: "[Carlos Gardel's] best-known compositions include *El día que me quieras*, *Mi Buenos Aires querido*, *Por una cabeza*, *Volver*, *Silencio* and *Cuesta abajo*. Perhaps the most successful tango ever written was Gerardo Matos Rodríguez's *La cumparsita* (1917), written in Montevideo. Other representative successful pieces are Julio César Sanders's *Adiós muchachos* (1928), Enrique Santos Discépolo's *Yira, yira* (1930), Ángel Villoldo's *El choclo* (1905), Juan Carlos Cobián's *Nostalgias*, Francisco Canaro's *Adiós, pampa mía*, and Edgardo Donato's *A media luz*. Although the tango lost some of its earlier popularity in the 1940s and 1950s it was revived in the 1960s and 1970s."

The bibliography of neither article includes Horacio Arturo Ferrer's *El Libro del Tango: crónica & diccionario, 1850-1977* (Buenos Aires: Editorial Galerna, 1977).



can Republic, Luis Humberto Salgado from Ecuador, Enrique Solares from Guatemala, Joaquín Gutiérrez Heras and Francisco Savín from Mexico exemplify other missing entries rectified by *Riemann*. Such omissions can be further multiplied by taking into account John Vinton's *Dictionary of Contemporary Music* (1974), *Baker's*, sixth edition, and the *Compositores de Américas* series started in 1955.

Folk music receives optimum coverage in the sections on Argentina and Peru by Isabel Aretz, on Venezuela by Luis Felipe Ramón y Rivera. The National Anthems article errs in making the tenth note of the Brazilian anthem a dotted eighth instead of dotted quarter, in dating the Colombian national anthem 1905 (composed in 1887 by Oreste Sindici, 1837-1904), in citing the fourth word of the Mexican national anthem as "del" and in wrongly syllabifying "guerra," in denying the Puerto Rican anthem adopted July 24, 1952, a text (by Manuel Fernández Juncos, beginning "La tierra de Borinquen / donde he nacido yo"), and in making the eighth word of the Venezuelan anthem "lencó."

So far as art-music in country articles goes: the brightest light in Potosí music history—Antonio Durán de la Mota, active in the early eighteenth century—goes unmentioned in the Bolivia article; the viceroyalty of Nueva Granada comprising what is now Colombia dates from 1717-1718, not 1566; Baltasar Martínez Compañón was never "cantor of Lima Cathedral"; it is not true that "no polyphonic work by a musician active in Quito has yet been found" (witness Blasco and Fernández Hidalgo mentioned in the next paragraph, v, 829) nor is it true that "there is little information about 18th-century church music in Ecuador"; the Guatemala article ignores the two most important and prolific native-born composers in Guatemala history: Manuel de Quiroz and Rafael Castellanos; Pedro de Gante was never "a member of Charles V's private chapel"; Juan de Lienas flourished at Mexico City about 1640, not in the "late 16th-century"; Juan Navarro who in 1604 published *Quatuor passionnes* was never "a Franciscan monk [in] the convent of S Rosa de S María de Valladolid" at what is now Morelia; Aldana who died in 1810 was not "considered the most prominent musician of the time"; nothing in the Fray Gregorio de Zuola manuscript is ascribed to Francisco Correa de Arauxo; the earliest towns in Venezuela were not "Nueva Córdoba (now Cumaná) founded in 1521, and Caracas, founded in 1567" but Nueva Córdoba and Coro founded in 1527; the political capital was moved from Coro to Caracas in 1577 not 1587 (Coro remaining the seat of the bishopric of Venezuela from its establishment by Clement VII's bull published July 21, 1531, to 1637 when the seat of the see was moved to Caracas); what is said in the Venezuela article (xix, 604) concerning an organist at "Caracas Cathedral in 1591" named Melchor Quintela is false, as are the other statements in this article concerning Caracas music history during the first century after founding the city.

Gratitude to the Editor-in-Chief for commissioning an unprecedented 250 biographies of Latin American composers and performers²⁴ penned by such illustrious authors as César Arróspide de la Flor, Alice Ray Catalyne, Aurelio de la Vega, and

²⁴Stanley Sadie, "Latinoamérica en el nuevo *Grove*," *Revista Musical Chilena*, xxx/134 (April-September 1976), 69-74. As summarized in the *Handbook of Latin American Studies: No. 38* (Gainesville: University of Florida Press, 1976), p. 549, item 9018:

Latin America is also represented in articles on Dictionaries, Education in music, Instrument collections, Libraries, Periodicals, Private collections. About seventy entries deal with Latin American dances and other local forms, such as bambuco, bossa nova, cueca, milonga, sanjuanito, tango. Many terms having varying significance in Latin America are properly differentiated, romance and bolero, for exam-



Juan Orrego-Salas inhibits any more than a token list of factual errors in articles written by them. As mere earnestness of what to expect: Francisco López Capillas was born at Mexico City not in Andalusia, and died in Mexico City January 18, 1674, not 1673. Manuel de Zumaya died at Oaxaca October 5, 1754, not "between March 12 and May 6, 1756." Not Zumaya but instead López Capillas is "the earliest known native cathedral maestro in Mexico City." Antonio de Salazar was not "a prebendary at Seville before going to Mexico," nor did he write "the earliest compositions" celebrating the Virgin of Guadalupe. Apparently unknown to the author of his article: (1) Salazar applied for a *bajonista* post in Mexico City Cathedral prior to becoming chapelmaster at Puebla; (2) he ranks as the first married maestro de capilla in Mexico City Cathedral annals; (3) in contrast with López Capillas and Zumaya he died intestate. The description of Salazar's musical style betrays the author's limited acquaintance with his works.

In the Chile article, the first opera composed in Chile is misspelled (should be *La Telésfora*) and José de Campderrós,⁹⁵ the ablest composer in Chile at the beginning of the nineteenth century, is omitted. Neither he nor Federico Guzmán gains a biographical entry. Opera composers receive short shrift. The Chile article mistakenly asserts that Eleodoro = Eliodoro Ortiz de Zárate's⁹⁶ graduation exercise from the Milan conservatory, *Juana la loca*, was mounted at La Scala.⁹⁷ Nor does the Chile article do him justice by mentioning that after *La Floresta de Lugano* (Santiago, Teatro Municipal, November 2, 1895) came next Ortiz de Zárate's *Lautaro* premiered in the Santiago Teatro Municipal August 12, 1902. Despite Próspero Bisquertt's winning the Chilean Premio Nacional de Arte in 1954, the article on him vaguely consigns to 1930 his two-act *Sayeda* premiered September 21, 1929.⁹⁸ Not only does the Chile article ignore Bisquertt's *Sayeda*, Carlos Melo Cruz's two-act *Mauricio* (1939), Pablo Garrido's one-act *La Sugestión* (1961, third or fourth performance 1972), Roberto Puelma's *Ardid de amor* (1972)—all of which were mounted in the Santiago de Chile Teatro Municipal—but also Juan Casanova Vicuña's *Erase un Rey* (Buenos Aires, Teatro Colón, September 12, 1947). For that matter, no twentieth-century Chilean stage work turns up anywhere in either the Chile or Santiago de Chile article.⁹⁹

Much to *The New Grove*-user's dismay, precise dates easily available in other lexicons elude numerous articles. Vicente Salas Viu (correctly spelled without the accent over "u") died at Santiago de Chile September 2, 1967. Vicente Emilio Sojo died at Caracas August 11, 1974. Luis Delgadillo's birth and death dates should be corrected

ple. City and country articles generously cover Latin America. Collaborators of ethnomusical articles include Isabel Aretz, María Ester Grebe, Luis Felipe Ramón y Rivera, and Roque Cordero.

⁹⁵Concerning him (mentioned in passing in the Santiago de Chile article) see Samuel Claro-Valdés's "José de Campderrós (1742-1812): de mercader catalán a maestro de capilla en Santiago de Chile," *Anuario Musical*, xxx-1975, 123-134.

⁹⁶See William Belmont Parker, "Eliodoro Ortiz de Zárate," in *Chileans of To-day* (New York: G.P. Putnam's Sons, 1920), pp. 293-295.

⁹⁷Pompeo Cambiasi's *La Scala 1778-1906 Note Storiche e Statistiche*, 5th ed. (Milan: G. Ricordi, 1906), confirms that no Ortiz de Zárate opera was mounted at La Scala.

⁹⁸Spelled Bisquert, iv, 231, but Bisquertt, ii, 746, his individual entry lacks any Bibliography. Apart from Salas Viu's *La Creación Musical en Chile*, see Gustavo Becerra, "Próspero Bisquertt, Premio Nacional de Arte," *Revista Musical Chilena*, ix/47 (October 1954), 18-29.

⁹⁹Significantly, the Bibliography of neither article itemizes Mario Cánepa Guzmán's *La Ópera en Chile (1839-1930)* (Santiago de Chile: Editorial Del Pacífico, 1976). The most recent item in the Santiago de Chile Bibliography dates from 1960.



to conform with *Baker's*, sixth edition. Rodolfo Halffter's birth date needs correction. The works lists of both the latter contain minor slips. The birth date of Gaspar Villate should read January 27, 1851.

The Cuba article misspells Villate's opera premiered at Paris December 1, 1877 (should be *Zilia*, not *Zeila*). José White lacks a biographical entry. Nor are he and his compatriot Claudio Brindis de Salas anywhere mentioned in the Cuba article. On the other hand, White and Brindis de Salas are profiled in *Riemann* [1972 and 1975]. The Cuba article Bibliography omits so fundamental a work as Edwin T. Tolón and Jorge A. González's 472-page *Óperas Cubanos y sus autores* (Havana: Ucar, García y Cía., 1943).

The article on the founding father of Cuban music, Esteban Salas y Castro, pretends at independent musical analysis but in actuality depends utterly on Alejo Carpentier's now outmoded Chapter 3 in *La Música en Cuba* (Mexico City: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 1946). Carpentier at page 62 stated that "in the course of years the two violins, one cello, two *bajones*, one harp, plus organ hired to play [Santiago de Cuba] cathedral music were joined—thanks to Salas's diligence—by flutes, oboes, horns, and violas, reaching the size of a classic orchestra capable at the end of the century of playing symphonies by Haydn, Pleyel, and Gossec, as well as religious music by Paisiello, Porpora and Righini." *The New Grove* author of the Salas y Castro article changes Carpentier's mere surmise to read: "Besides composing music for the cathedral, he conducted Cuba's first chamber ensemble performing symphonies by Haydn, Pleyel and Gossec and sacred works by Paisiello, Porpora and Righini."

Another example of the author's borrowed plumage: the article states that Salas's "*Pues la fábrica de un templo* (1783), shows Spanish influence and begins with an instrumental section having the character of a Scarlatti sonata." This assertion is merely a misleading rehash of Carpentier's circumspectly stated opinion (page 69): "In the villancico *Pues la fábrica de un templo* (1783) we find certain measures of marked Spanish character, which we might be able to liken to certain passages in Scarlatti's Sonatas."

Even more irritating than the author's pompous pretense of having himself personally analyzed Salas y Castro's oeuvre is the incorrect works list and deficient Bibliography. He can tell us nothing of Salas's first 38 years because he never read "Esteban de Salas y Castro en el Archivo Nacional," *Boletín del Archivo Nacional*, LVII-1958 (Havana, 1959), 119-126. Quoting the Cuban National archive, *Correspondencia de los Capitanes Generales, Legajo 49, número 4*, this article contains the diplomatic transcript of a Memorial to the Spanish Crown from the Santiago de Cuba cathedral chapter dated April 12, 1796, enumerating 71-year-old Salas's qualifications for a retiree's pension. This article also contains Salas's certified baptismal record and concludes with the reprinting of José Luciano Franco's article "Salas, el Compositor Olvidado," published in the Havana magazine *Carteles*, No. 46, November 15, 1953, to commemorate the sesquicentennial of Salas's death July 14, 1803. According to the cathedral chapter's Memorial:

Esteban Salas y Castro was born December 25, 1725, at Havana of honorable but poor parents. His father, Tomás de Salas y Castro, was the son of *alférez* Antonio de Salas, native of Tenerife [Canary Islands] where he did his military service. His mother, Petrona de Montes de Oca [a native of Havana], was the daughter of the *alférez con grado de teniente* Ignacio de Montes de Oca who served in the garrison at Havana. Salas was baptized in the Havana parish church of



Santo Cristo del Buen Viaje and confirmed at Havana by Bishop Juan Laso de la Vega y Cansino.

From earliest youth Salas was a diligent scholar. After finishing grammar [in the Real Colegio Seminario de San Carlos y San Ambrosio] he enrolled in the University of Havana [founded by Dominicans January 5, 1728, in their *convento de San Juan de Letrán*]. Upon brilliantly completing Philosophy he next studied Theology three years with equal success. However, after finishing Canon Law, he fell victim to life-threatening seizures that forced him to withdraw without being ordained priest.

He began studying music in 1734, in that year entering the choir of the Havana Iglesia Matriz as boy soprano. Without detriment to his previously mentioned studies he learned to compose and to play various instruments. [Cayetano Pagueras, the Catalonian maestro of Havana *matriz* was his probable teacher.] What money he made, he used to support his widowed mother and the rest of the family, care of which fell on his shoulders after his father's death. He continued as a musician at Havana until 1763 when Bishop Pedro Agustín Morell de Santa Cruz sent him to Santiago de Cuba Cathedral for the express purpose of founding and conducting a polyphonic choir—until then in abeyance. What he has accomplished since then, we all know from personal observation.

He arrived at this city in February of 1764, presented his credentials, joined the cathedral staff, and began at once to work so diligently and effectively that in short order this cathedral began hearing the kind of music long and ardently desired before his coming, but never obtained. His training in Philosophy and Theology was so complete that he taught both subjects in our diocesan seminary, Theology for twelve years after various three-year Philosophy sequences. His pupils have obtained degrees at the universities of Havana, Santo Domingo, and Santa Fe [de Bogotá] and have returned to teach in our seminary the very subjects that they studied with him.

Meanwhile his modesty continued such that not until deceased Bishop Antonio Feliu y Centena [died June 25, 1791] impelled him to do so did he on March 20, 1790 [in his 65th year] receive priestly orders, thereafter adding to his previous occupations the confessional and pulpit.

As if it were not enough for the author of the Salas y Castro article to have missed all this information, his Bibliography also omits the following crucial publications: Pablo Hernández Balaguer's "En Torno a los Villancicos de Esteban Salas," *Revista de Música* [Biblioteca Nacional "José Martí"], 1/2 (April 1960), 44-55; *Catálogo de Música de los archivos de la Catedral de Santiago de Cuba y del Museo Bacardí* (Havana: Biblioteca Nacional "José Martí" 1961 [Salas's works are itemized at pp. 48-59]); "Esteban Salas y el primer impreso hecho en Santiago de Cuba," *Revista de la Universidad de Oriente*, 1/2 (March 1962), 32-39 [Salas's villancico texts printed at Santiago by Matías Alqueza in 1793 inaugurated printing in that city]; "La capilla de música de la catedral de Santiago de Cuba," *Revista Musical Chilena*, XVIII/90 (October-December 1964), 14-61 [Salas's life and works, pp. 20-48; musical excerpts, pp. 49-55; endnotes follow]. The Bibliography ought certainly to have itemized publication of Salas's *Claras luces, villancico de Navidad a cuatro voces con violines y bajo* in facsimile edition (Santiago: Universidad de Oriente, Departamento de Actividades Culturales, 1961) and of Hernández Balaguer's transcription of another *Cuatro villancicos, partitura* (Havana: Ediciones del Depto. de Música de la Biblioteca Nacional "José Martí," 1961). Among a flurry of 250th-birthday events, the one worthiest of mention in *The New Grove* would have been the *Concierto conmemorativo 250 años del nacimiento de Esteban Salas* (Havana: Comisión Nacional Cubana de la UNESCO [Boletín UNESCO 15:62, March-April 1976, pp. 12-15, Program



Notes by Hilario González, transcriber of 106 works performed during the 1975 Cuban Festival de Coros]).

The same author who wrote *The New Grove* article on Esteban Salas y Castro wrote also the articles on the nineteenth-century Cubans Ignacio Cervantes (Kawanag) and Gaspar Villate (y Montes). Again, Carpentier provided this lax author with his sole data. As a result, he knows neither day nor month of Villate's birth, mistakes the title of *Le prime armi di Richelieu*, lists *Angelo* without stating that Villate destroyed this unproduced effort of his adolescence, and mentions only such non-operatic works by Villate as Carpentier listed. Because he ignores the only extensive and unbiased study of Villate's life and works,¹⁰⁰ he fails to state that Villate's family had to emigrate to the United States in 1868 for political reasons, that Villate returned to Havana in 1871, that his European sojourns coincided with his successful attempts to get three of his operas produced (*Zilia*, Paris, December 1, 1877; *La czarine*, The Hague, February 2, 1880; *Baltasar*, Madrid, February 28, 1885), and that Villate left a legacy to found a school for Havana youths ten to eighteen years of age (training them in useful occupations).

Another equally unfortunate effort by the same author in *The New Grove* is the eleven-line article with defective works list on so central a figure in Cuban musical life before Fidel Castro as Eduardo Sánchez de Fuentes. Both Laureano Fuentes Matons and Nicolás Ruiz Espadero escape biographical entries.

If Cuba emerges less honorably than the island's history warrants, the same can be said for the two nations in the next largest Caribbean island. Ellwood Derr's article on Joseph Boulogne, Chevalier de Saint-Georges, mentions his possibly having studied violin with the Black [Joseph] Platon in Saint-Domingue, now Haiti. *The New Grove* extensively covers ethnic music in both Haiti and the Dominican Republic but lacks articles on art-music in each. No recent Haitian composers, such as those profiled in Dumervé's *Histoire de la musique en Haïti* (Port-au-Prince, 1968)—Occides Jeanty fils (1860–1936), Nicolas Fénélon Geffrard (1871–1930), Fernand Franguel (1872–1911), Ludovic Lamothe (1882–1936), and Justin Elie (1883–1931)—are rewarded with separate biographical entries. Nor is any hint given of the extensive and richly documented eighteenth-century musical life in Saint-Domingue. Jean Fouchard's four books published in 1953 and 1955 reveal a flourishing musical life at Port-au-Prince, Cap-Français (= Cap Haïtien), Saint-Marc, Léogane, Cayes, Jérémie, Petit-Goave, and Jacmel that included performances of 21 stage works by Grétry between 1769 and 1790, of Rameau's *Les Indes galantes* March 13, 1771, of Gluck's *Iphigénie en Aulide* September 5, 1789, and of a correspondingly important stage repertory by Gossec, Monsigny, Paisiello, Pergolesi, Piccini, and Rousseau. Among instrumental composers, Davaux, Cambini, and Le Breton were popular. At least three operas by composers locally active in Saint-Domingue were produced, Dufresne's *Laurette* (October 28, 1775), Bissery's *Le Sourd dupé* (June 21, 1777) and *Bouquet disputé* (June 18, 1783). Dufresne composed a *grande symphonie concertante à deux orchestres et à echo* (August 15, 1778), Bissery a *concerto sur forte-piano* (February 22, 1777). Rivière, a Black violinist-composer, wrote symphonies concertantes performed at Cayes (October 12, 1787) and also *ariettes à grand orchestre*, *sérénades champêtres*, and *pot-pourris* for *grand orchestre* (March 4, November 23, 1786, and January 18, 1787).

¹⁰⁰Tolón and González, *Operas Cubanas y sus autores*, pp. 123–276.



The New Grove article on Victor Pelissier fails to reveal that before emigrating to the United States he had been first French horn at Cap Français—despite Sonneck's having documented Pelissier's Saint-Dominigue sojourn (*Early Opera in America*, page 212). Musical life at New Orleans, Charleston, Philadelphia, and New York, at Santiago de Cuba, and at Havana profited immensely from "the French invasion which began in 1790"—an invasion (as Sonneck correctly remarked, *Early Opera*, 197) that was wholly due to the French Revolution and its aftermath in France's richest colony, Saint-Domingue. If only because of its historical importance, does not Haiti therefore deserve art-music coverage? Already in the sixteenth century, Santo Domingo (which until 1697 included what is now Haiti) boasted an important musical culture (*A Guide to Caribbean Music History*, 1975, pages 42, 53-54). *The New Grove* lacks any coverage of not only Haitian eighteenth- and nineteenth-century but also Santo Domingo sixteenth- and seventeenth-century art-music history.

The Jamaica article fails to mention Samuel Felsted, organist at St. Andrew's parish church (built during Queen Anne's reign), who in 1775 published *Jonah, an Oratorio, Disposed for a Voice and Harpsichord* (London: Lukey & Broderip; copy in the British Library). Dedicated to Mrs. John Dalling, wife of the Lieutenant Governor of Jamaica, this oratorio enjoyed a long life. In 1779 it was performed in Jamaica. It was also performed—as its modern champion Thurston J. Dox discovered—December 2, 1789, at Boston, and June 11, 1788, June 18, 1789, and December 9, 1802 at New York City. At least one nineteenth-century composer who rates a three-column *New Grove* article was born in Kingston. At the other end of the spectrum, the Jamaica article mentions ska and calypso. Why not also reggae and Bob Marley?

The New Grove allots two columns to Reynaldo Hahn born at Caracas, Venezuela. The other nineteenth-century international celebrity born at Caracas was Teresa Carreño. Her "revised" but unimproved article by Norman Fraser (carried over from the fifth edition) enumerates her four marriages but misdates the first two. *The New Grove* article on the violin virtuoso Émile Sauret whom she married in June 1873 correctly dates their marriage that year; the Teresa Carreño article gives 1872. Her second marriage (to the operatic baritone Giovanni Tagliapietra) occurred a year later than the date in *The New Grove*. Her String Quartet did not grow out of her marriage with Sauret but was composed two decades later—in 1895, year of her divorce from her third husband Eugen D'Albert. Premiered at the Leipzig Gewandhaus September 29, 1896, and favorably if "somewhat condescendingly" reviewed, her Quartet in B minor was published the next year by Fritzsch (Leipzig). At death she left unpublished a serenade for string orchestra.

The worst of the Teresa Carreño article is its emphasis on her personal life at the expense of her musical accomplishment. In an article on the supreme woman pianist of her generation, why not a list of her published compositions instead of an itemizing of her four marriages? Margery Lowens's MacDowell article, xi, 420, mentions Teresa Carreño's services to one American composer. In 1898, Carreño also introduced Amy Marcy Cheney Beach to German audiences, playing with Karel Halír Beach's *Sonata in A minor*, op. 34 (composed in 1896). At her opening Berlin solo concert of the 1903 season she again programmed Beach. Long after other artists had dropped Gottschalk, she played him during her 1907 Australian tour.

The founder of the Teresa Carreño Conservatory at Caracas was José Antonio Calcaño. His article does not carry his writings beyond 1967, or mention that he won the Venezuelan Premio Nacional de Música por Méritos in 1977. After his death (not



mentioned) September 11, 1978, President Carlos Andrés Paz decreed three days of national mourning.

As far as dates of other Venezuelans go, Rhazes Hernández López was born in 1916, not 1918 (xix, 605). The birth year of José Angel Montero requires correction and precise dates are needed for the premiere of *Virginia*, its revival at Caracas in 1969, and for his death. The Montero Bibliography omits crucial publications.

The next Latin American woman pianist after Carreño who enters *The New Grove* is Guiomar Novães. Although her 20-line article corrects her badly wrong birth year in the fifth edition, it lacks any Bibliography and fails to mention her death at São Paulo March 7, 1979. *Current Biography 1953* gave her three pages. Her *New York Times* obituary March 9, 1979 treated her as a major luminary. The Myra Hess article in *The New Grove* mentions Hess's playing the Howard Ferguson piano concerto but the Claudio Arrau article said nothing of his having performed Chávez's Piano Concerto and solo pieces by his compatriots Santa Cruz and Allende. The inconsequential Martha Argerich article (no Bibliography) mentions her birth at Buenos Aires but says nothing of her services (if any) to Latin American music. Jesús María Sanromá unjustly lacks a *New Grove* entry.

At the close of his lengthy article on Carlos Chávez, Gilbert Chase questionably ranks him as "the leading Latin American composer of his generation." With equal justice Luiz Heitor Corrêa de Azevedo could have concluded his article on Heitor Villa-Lobos with the same claim. H. Wiley Hitchcock, "adviser on American music" for *The New Grove*, wrote the article on Chase, born September 4, 1906, at Havana. Gerard Béhague, Hitchcock's Latin American counterpart, wrote the article on Corrêa de Azevedo born December 13, 1905, at Rio de Janeiro. The article on Béhague born November 2, 1937, at Montpellier was written by Paula Margaret Morgan, previously mentioned as author of the defective article on Nicolas Slonimsky. She also wrote the article on H(ugh) Wiley Hitchcock born September 28, 1923, at Detroit.

Not herself profiled in *The New Grove*, despite her voluminous contributions, Morgan permitted the following data to be published in *A Biographical Directory of Librarians in the United States and Canada*, Fifth Edition (Chicago: American Library Association, 1970), page 776:

Born August 11, 1935, at Modesto, California, she attended Mills College 1953-1957, graduating Phi Beta Kappa with A.B. in music. From Columbia University which she attended 1957-1959 she obtained a musicological M.A. She continued musicology studies 1959-1963 at the University of California, Berkeley; in 1963-1964 she studied library science, obtaining the M.L.S. from Berkeley in 1964. That year she became music librarian at Princeton University.

Her articles on Lewis Lockwood "consulting editor for *The New Grove* in the United States" and member of the Princeton music faculty 1958 to 1980 (professor 1968), on Kenneth Levy "professor at Brandeis University from 1954 to 1966 when he returned to Princeton," on Harold S(tone) Powers who "in 1973 became professor of music at Princeton" and on Edward T(oner) Cone, who "taught at Princeton from 1947," count as models. Only when she moves outside the Princeton circle does the quality of her entries progressively slacken [see her coverage of Barry S(helley) Brook, Peter Crossley-Holland, Charles Hamm, Leeman L(oyd) Perkins, H(arry) Colin Slim, Victor (Fell) Yellin, and Franklin B(ershir) Zimmerman].

In concluding summary: *The New Grove* amply justifies its unique fame so far as phases of music and musicology interesting to the Princeton music faculty go. (Charles



Rosen, Princeton B.A., M.A., and Ph.D., and author of what may well rank as the most perceptive among many reviews of *The New Grove*, profoundly prefers Princeton's prevailing philosophy of music history.) What chiefly matters for them is "greatness in music." Folk and ethnic can prosper in their scheme, popular music much less, anything below what they deem superlative art-music not at all.

The generosity and goodwill of the Editor-in-Chief opened wide the doors of *The New Grove* to New World contributions. However, New World contributors on New World subjects all too often supplied hastily written and incompetently researched articles—especially on topics dismissed by Princeton intellectuals as "poor ill-favoured Audrey things." Although Americans nurtured in the Princeton mould will not care, Touchstones in the hemisphere must still continue insisting on more conscientious treatment for "things that are mine own."

FRANCE

Jean-Jacques Rousseau's *Dictionnaire de Musique* (Paris: Chez la Veuve Duchesne, 1768)¹ concludes with a set of plates; N contains an *Air Chinois*, *Chanson Persane*, a purported *Chanson des Sauvages du Canada*, and a *Danse Canadienne*. Smoke-screening the many errors that he made in transcribing from his professed sources, Rousseau prefaced these ethnic melodies with the following description (page 314):

Pour mettre le Lecteur à portée de juger des divers Accens musicaux des Peuples, j'ai transcrit aussi dans la Planche un Air Chinois tiré du P. du Halde, un Air Persan tiré du Chevalier Chardin, & deux Chansons des Sauvages de l'Amérique tirées du P. Mersenne. On trouvera dans tous ces morceaux une conformité de Modulation avec notre Musique, qui pourra faire admirer aux uns la bonté & l'universalité de nos règles, & peut-être rendre suspecte à d'autres l'intelligence ou la fidélité de ceux qui nous ont transmis ces Airs.

To give the reader an opportunity to judge the different ethnic styles, I have transcribed on an accompanying plate a Chinese air taken from Father Du Halde, a Persian air taken from the Chevalier Chardin, and two songs of the American savages taken from Father Mersenne. Because these pieces so closely fit our own melodic schemes, some will admire the wisdom and universality of our rules, while others will doubt that the melodies in question have been faithfully transmitted to us.

Rousseau's botching of the "Chinese air" has been already exposed elsewhere.² What he calls "Song of the Savages of Canada" did indeed reach him from *Liure Troisième. Des Genres, des especes, des Systemes, & des Modes de la Musique. Proposition II* of Marin Mersenne's *Traitez des Consonances, des Dissonances . . .* (facsimile reprint in *Harmonie universelle* [Paris: Éditions du Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, 1963], II, 148 [second foliation]). However, Mersenne correctly cited the examples of Tupynambá music that he quoted in 1636 from the 1592 Theodor de Bry edition of Jean de Léry's *Histoire d'un Voyage fait en la Terre du Bresil (Trois Chansons des Ameriquains)* as being three distinct melodies. In his

¹Englished by William Waring as *The Complete Dictionary of Music* (London: J. French, 1770). Editions in French at Amsterdam (1768, 1769, 1772), Geneva (1781, 1790), and Paris (1779, 1793, 1817, 1821, 1825, 1826, 1832, 1839) attest the lengthy viability of this dictionary finished by Rousseau December 20, 1764, after eleven years of desultory confection. See Albert Jansen, *Jean-Jacques Rousseau als Musiker* (Berlin: Georg Reimer, 1884), 482.

²"Written Sources for Indian Music until 1882," *Ethnomusicology*, xvii/1 (January 1973), 17.



accompanying text, Mersenne correctly named Léry as his source but omitted mentioning Brazil as the land visited by Léry.

Rousseau carelessly assumed that all three songs in Mersenne (songs I, III, and IV at pages 159, 279, and 285 in Léry's 1585 edition) came from Canada—probably because the musical notation above them in Mersenne is labeled *Chanson Canadoise*. Not content with belying the rhythm of the *Chanson Canadoise* = *Canadienne*, Rousseau traduces the three Tupynambá songs by making them all one continuous melody sung not by Brazilian, but by Canadian tribesmen. He first mentions Plate N containing all his ethnic examples in a letter dated August 18, 1765, to Pierre Guy⁴ (1715–1795), manager of the Duchesne firm that published his *Dictionnaire*: “You will receive the proofs of Plates L and M with corrections on the back of one of them. So far as Plate N goes, since no important correction is needed, you can proceed with it as is.” Plate F he did later require corrected (letter to Pierre Guy dated November 15, 1766)⁵ but never N.

Plate N illustrates Rousseau's long *Dictionnaire* article entitled “Musique.” This same diffuse article returns (with some adjustments) as the unsigned article on “Musique” in the third edition of Diderot's *Encyclopédie ou Dictionnaire raisonné des sciences, des arts et des métiers* (Geneva: Jean Léonard Pellet, 1779), xxii, 601b–612a. At 610b, allusion is made to the plate containing “deux chansons des sauvages de l'Amérique.” But Plate IV, Fig. 2 in the *Recueil de Planches. Tome Second*, corrects all that was amiss in Plate N of the *Dictionnaire*. The three melodies from Léry (I, III, IV) via Mersenne now no longer emerge as one continuous melody. Instead, the three fragments are separated from each other by repeat signs. Moreover, they are no longer attributed to Canadians but merely to “Sauvages de l'Amérique.”

Did Rousseau himself have anything to do with these 1779 plate corrections? The annotator of the music plates in the *Recueil de Planches. Tome Second*, page 7 of “Musique,” added information on what he conceived to be the emotional thrust of each Tupynambá song: the first is “a gay refrain incessantly repeated by the Tupy-nambás when happy”; the second “a faster refrain sung on only two notes to one syllable”; the third “a slow, sad song appropriate for funerals and laments.”⁶ To show himself still more knowledgeable, the annotator of the *Recueil de Planches. Tome Second* decreed that “Americans in general favor short repeated snatches re-

¹For an unravelling of the complicated transmission history of Léry's five Tupynambá songs (Geneva 1585 edition, pp. 159, 173, 279, 285, 286) see Manuel Vicente Ribeiro Veiga, Jr., “Toward a Brazilian Ethnomusicology: Amerindian Phases” (University of California at Los Angeles Ph.D. dissertation, 1981), pp. 218–219. Heiza Camêu, *Introdução ao Estudo da Música Indígena Brasileira* (Rio de Janeiro: Conselho Federal de Cultura e Departamento de Assuntos Culturais, 1977), p. 98, published a facsimile of Rousseau's Plate N, and at pp. 87, 89, 91–93 facsimiles of Léry's melodies as they appeared in his 1585 edition.

²Concerning him, see *Correspondance complète de Jean Jacques Rousseau*, ed. R.A. Leigh, vii (Oxford: The Voltaire Foundation at the Taylor Institution, 1969), 383. The August 18, 1765, letter is in *Correspondance complète*, xxvi (1976), 229–230.

³*Correspondance complète*, xxxi (1978), 160.

⁴In his 1585 text, Léry identified *Canide-iouue* (Song I) as a repeated refrain sung in joyous praise of a handsome yellow bird, *He he he* (Song III) as a refrain bandied at first tremulously between men and women at the beginning of a religious ceremonial, *Heu, heuraüre* (Song IV) as a refrain repeated bravely two hours later during the same ceremonial by five or six hundred male Tupynambás who were egged on by their tobacco-smoking shamans (Caribes). The emotional character read into the same Songs I, III, and IV by the annotator of Plate IV in the 1779 *Recueil de Planches. Tome Second* flatly contradicts Léry.



sembling the *tan-la-la-ri* and *tan-la-la-lire* of old vaudevilles and "transmit everything orally."

The misinformation on American indigenous music cast adrift by Rousseau—even if partially corrected in the *Recueil de Planches. Tome Second* of the Diderot *Encyclopédie*,⁷ third edition—still continues doing damage. As recently as 1977 in her 362-page *Introdução ao Estudo da Música Indígena Brasileira* the well-informed ethnomusicological scholar Helza Camêu took seriously Rousseau's mislabelings on Plate N of the 1768 *Dictionnaire*. As precedent for doing so, she appealed to François-Joseph Fétis's *Histoire générale de la musique* (Paris: Firmin Didot Frères, Fils et Cie, 1869), I, 13–14. Fétis decreed that the Caraiques identified by Léry as Tupynambá shamans were instead Black Caribs, and that Léry's Tupynambá Melodies I plus IV were sung not only by Canadians (on Rousseau's authority), but also by Polynesians and Black Caribs.

Apparently unaware of Mersenne's prior quotation of Léry's melodies, Camêu pointlessly queries Rousseau's *Chanson des Sauvages du Canada* [1768: Plate N]: "Coincidence? Interpretation? Fantasy?"—rather than recognizing that Rousseau merely miscopied Mersenne. She also takes seriously F.-J. Fétis who, according to her, was "the first to attend to the coincidences found between primary songs collected from several peoples: Black Caribs, Indians of Canada, and Polynesians." She even goes so far astray as to contend that "primitive music being the case, made with a limited number of sounds, the similarities pointed to are admissible" [Camêu 1977: 100 ("Tratando-se de música primitiva, feita com limitado número de sons, são admissíveis as semelhanças apontadas")].

Mathematically, it is impossible for even the four pitches (g, f, e, d) of Rousseau's misattributed melody from the Canadian "sauvages" and the same chant misattributed to "Black Caribs" and Polynesians by the arrogant Fétis, to be identically arranged in 32 or 39 slots by any mere coincidence. Worse still, Camêu seriously proposes the possibility that not only melodies but also texts of the Brazilian songs misattributed to Canadian "sauvages," Black Caribs, and Polynesians, could be coincidentally identical.⁸

Wrong as was Fétis on anything having to do with American Indians, he committed errors hardly less gross when compiling biographies. Robert Wangermée, author of the article on Fétis in *The New Grove*, summed up the present critical estimate of Fétis's eight-volume *Biographie universelle des musiciens et bibliographie générale de la musique* (Brussels: Leroux; Meline, Cans & Cie, 1835–1844) and of the eight-volume second augmented edition (Paris: Firmin Didot, 1860–1865) thus:⁹

Although a prodigious summary of the erudition of its own epoch, it cannot today be trusted. Every statement in it must be verified. What truths it does contain cannot be easily separated from the many errors.

Fétis's mischances border on the gross when anyone born or ever domiciled in the New World is in issue. To believe him, Sigismund Neukomm (1778–1858) served as

⁷Despite the torrent of Rousseau scholarship that continues flowing, his *Dictionnaire de musique* and its relationships with articles on music published in the *Encyclopédie* "have yet to be systematically examined," commented Richard N. Schwab in his *Inventory of Diderot's Encyclopédie (Studies on Voltaire and the Eighteenth Century, LXXX [Geneva: Institut et Musée Voltaire, 1971])*, p. 203.

⁸Veiga, "Toward a Brazilian Ethnomusicology: Amerindian Phases," pp. 193–194.

⁹*François-Joseph Fétis et la vie musicale de son temps 1784–1871* (Brussels: Bibliothèque Royale Albert I^{er}, 1972), xvi.



chapelmaster to Pedro¹⁰ while in Rio de Janeiro and left only because the revolution in Brazil forced the king to return to Europe. According to Fétis, the family name of Marcos Antônio Portugal (1762–1830) was Simão and Marcos Antônio Simão became Portogallo = Portugal in Italy "because he was a Portuguese composer."

He accompanied the Portuguese court to Rio de Janeiro in November of 1807 as *maître de chapelle* and remained there until 1815 when with royal permission he returned to Europe. He made his last trip to Milan that year for the carnival production of *Adriano in Siria*. He next wrote for a Milan theatre a work to be discussed below. After the king's return to Lisbon, he rejoined the royal service and died at Lisbon at the end of 1829 or beginning of 1830.

Fétis's misinformation—corrected in Ernesto Vieira's article on Marcos Antônio Portugal in his *Diccionario Biographico de Musicos Portuguezes* (Lisbon: Mattos Moreira & Pinheiro, 1900), II, 208–212—should instead read thus: accompanied by his brother Simão he joined the court at Rio de Janeiro in 1811 (not 1807); he remained there nine years after João VI's return to Lisbon and died poor at Rio de Janeiro February 7, 1830; he was buried there in Santo Antônio Convento. The two-act *Adriano in Siria* to Metastasio's libretto (first set by Caldara in 1732) was a pasticcio. Produced at the Teatro Nuovo at Padua in June 1813, the music by Portugal was adapted by Domenico Mombelli.

Despite a birth date wrong by six years, Fétis's one article having Latin American connections that can still be read with profit must be the one on the Chevalier de Saint-Georges, born on Guadeloupe island (in 1739, not 1745). John Antes (1740–1811), although not identified as born at Bethlehem, Pennsylvania, gains entry because in 1801 he patented "a pedal that would turn music pages on a stand." Francis Hopkinson's *An improved method of quilling the harpsichord* (*Transactions of the American Philosophical Society Held at Philadelphia*, XIX, 185–194) cited with correct page numbers, testifies to Fétis's penchant for anything having to do with instruments. His Benjamin Franklin article, commencing with an old, rather than new style birth date, contains useful data, some details valuably supplementing the Benjamin Franklin article in so recent a lexicon as *The New Grove*.

After Fétis, Albert Lavignac initiated the next full-scale French-language lexicography with an *Encyclopédie de la musique et Dictionnaire du Conservatoire* that includes in Part 1, volume 5 (Paris: Librairie Delagrave, 1922) a densely packed 88-page (3244–3332) section on États-Unis d'Amérique by Esther Singleton (November 4, 1865, Baltimore; July 2, 1930, Stonington, Connecticut)¹¹ followed by shorter sections on American Indian music by Gaston Knosp (3333–3336), and indigenous

¹⁰Not Pedro (1798–1831) but João VI ruled Brazil during Neukomm's five years there, 1816–1821. Pedro, emperor of Brazil 1822–1831, abdicated and returned to Lisbon in 1831. Son of João VI and heir to the throne during Neukomm's Rio de Janeiro sojourn, Pedro studied with Neukomm, as did also Pedro's wife Leopoldina and sister Isabel Maria. Not Neukomm but Marcos Portugal was *maître de chapelle* at Rio de Janeiro 1816–1821. See Luiz Heitor Corrêa de Azevedo, "An Austrian Composer in the New World," *Musical Quarterly*, XLV/4 (October 1959), 475–479.

¹¹A descendant of important colonial families, she moved to New York City in 1887. Immersing herself in musical and literary criticism, she began publishing books in the 1890's (chiefly with Dodd, Mead) that by the time of her death totalled 73 titles—many of them reprinted more than five times. For her biography see John William Leonard, *Woman's Who's Who of America 1914–1915* (New York: American Commonwealth Company, 1914), p. 749; *Who's Who in America* [xv] 1928–29, p. 1908; *Who Was Who Among North American Authors 1921–1939* (Detroit: Gale Research Company, 1976), pp. 1310–1311.

music of Mexico, Peru, Ecuador, and Bolivia (3336-3371), by Raoul and Marguerite d'Harcourt. Richard Jackson, whose *United States Music Sources of bibliography and collective biography* (Brooklyn: Institute for Studies in American Music [I.S.A.M. Monographs: Number 1], 1973) does not recognize the existence of Esther Singleton's monograph, credits Gilbert Chase with being the first

to give major consideration to popular-vernacular forms and to declare that these forms were quite as worthy of study as art music. Today this belief is widely accepted and one suspects that Mr. Chase's book is to a considerable degree responsible.

Singleton, rather than Chase, deserves being called first in the field, because Part I of her history (documented with numerous musical examples) begins with Afro-American (18 columns), proceeds through Creole (8 columns) and Negro minstrelsy (4 columns) to popular songs (14 columns: Stephen C. Foster, Septimus Winner, Henry Clary Work, many others, ending with George Cohan), and concludes with patriotic and national songs (28 columns). Only in Part II (Art Music) does she broach such conventional topics as New England beginnings, Yankee tunesmiths, first instruments (including organs) in the colonies, concerts and early music publications; next: choral organizations, musical clubs, societies, and festivals. Part II, Section 3, deals with orchestras attached to a single locale or travelling organizations, military music, and brass bands. Section 4 divides American opera history into eight periods (1750-1825, 1825-1827, 1827-1832, 1832-1834, 1835-1843, 1844-1884, 1884-1890, 1891-1921). Section 5 includes biographies of 47 art-music composers ranging from Francis Hopkinson to Arthur Farwell and Charles Wakefield Cadman (including five women). Section 6 treats successively of World War I songs, society dance music of the elegant types popularized by Vernon and Irene Castle, Ragtime, and Jazz. In a seven-column epilogue she epitomizes American Indian music.

Oh, you beautiful doll (lyrics, A. Seymour Brown; music Nat D. Ayer, 1911) and *Waiting for the Robert E. Lee* (lyrics, L. Wolfe Gilbert, music Lewis F. Muir, 1912) exemplify her remarks on Ragtime. For data on the birth of the term jazz, she cites the anonymous article "Jazz origin again discovered," *Music Trade Review*, LXVIII (June 14, 1919), pages 32-33. Singleton's citation—crediting a Black cornet and piccolo player at Sam Hare's cafe in Chicago named Jasbo Brown with having given jazz its name around 1914—continued being copied by jazz historians as late as 1932.¹² The name Jasbo from the French *chasse beau* (an expression popular in New Orleans from the 1830's "to denote a dandy, or a hip Gallic Don Juan"¹³) roots Jasbo Brown in New Orleans, whatever his Chicago connections in 1914. Among favorite jazz selections in 1919, Singleton cites *Walkin' the dog*, *Tackin' the carpet*, *Texas Tommy*, *Darktown strutters' ball*,¹⁴ *Coffee coolers' tea*, and *Light brown babies' ball*. According to her, Shelton Brooks¹⁵ was the first in Chicago to compose a blues

¹²Concerning this widely disseminated etymology, see Alan P. Merriam and Bradley H. Garner, "Jazz—the Word," *Ethnomusicology*, xii/3 (September 1968), 375.

¹³*Ibid.*, 380.

¹⁴Original Dixieland Jazz Band's first recording, January 24, 1917. See Brian Rust, *Jazz Records A-Z 1897-1931* (Hatch End, Middlesex [England]: The Author, 1962), p. 474.

¹⁵A pianist, Shelton Brooks, recorded *I Got What It Takes To Bring You Back* and *Original Blues* with Sara Martin April 9, 1923 (Okeh, 8062). See John Goodrich and Robert M.W. Dixon, *Blues & Gospel Records 1902-1942* (London: Storyville Publications Co., 1969), p. 468. Earlier he copyrighted *I Want to Shimmie*, *Wake Me Up*, and *Tell Me Why* (1919), and in 1920 a collection called *Jazz-dance repertoire* (New York: Jerome H. Remick & Co.).



(*Hesitation Blues*). *Livery stable blues* and *Alcoholic blues* typified the deluge of urban blues that followed. James Reese Europe (1881-1919), leader of Europe's Society Orchestra (1913) and Jim Europe's 369th Infantry ("Hell Fighters") Band (1919), takes pride of place among Blacks who carried jazz to the Continent.

Lavignac contains nothing on Latin America to counterpart Singleton's epoch-making survey of the multifaceted United States. Anticipating their monumental two-volume *La musique des Incas et ses survivances* (Paris: Paul Geuthner, 1925), the d'Harcourt pair do summarize Andean traditional music—both Indian and mestizo. Of their 36 illustrative examples, nos. 4 (Huancavelica, Peru), 5-6, 8 (Cuenca region, Ecuador), and 11 (Cuenca) purport to be "purely Indian." Most of the remaining notations exemplify an Andean highland mixture of European and Indian musics. Excellent linedrawings of Peruvian (Figs. 763-765, 769, 772-777, 779-781, 783-786) instruments—some of them archaeological instruments, some modern—notably enhance the text. By contrast, Mexican archaeological instruments (766-768, 771, 778, 782) occupy only a small niche. As a result, the reader may incorrectly presume that preconquest music in the Aztec area was puny, compared with music in the Inca area. None of their 36 musical examples comes from Mexico.

The credentials of the triumvirate who in 1957 edited the handsomely illustrated two-volume *Larousse de la musique* (Paris: Librairie Larousse) glittered: Norbert Dufourcq (doctorat ès lettres, University of Paris, 1935; professor of music history and musicology at the Conservatoire, 1941 to 1975; president of the Société française de Musicologie, 1957 to 1959) was aided by Félix Raugel (1881-1975; musical director of Anthologie Sonore, 1949 to 1959) and Armand Machabey (1886-1966). The article "États-Unis" by Robert Erich Wolf, a far cry from Singleton's, begins with this pronouncement: "The first colony, Jamestown (1607), was Catholic; the second, Massachusetts, established in 1620, was Protestant, and did not permit secular music. However, it did permit psalm-singing as an element of the cult. . . . During the second half of the 17th century, psalms were progressively eliminated, to be replaced in the 18th century by the hymns of Watts." So far as the nineteenth century goes, the author ("docteur en philosophie de l'Université de Liège, musicologue, compositeur") mentions Jenny Lind, Ole Bull, Henriette Sontag, Sigismund Thalberg, and Henri Herz, but not Louis Moreau Gottschalk. Among individual biographies, this Larousse makes no recompense with any article on the latter (despite an article on Alexandre Gottschalk, 1827-1908, a German organist). Nor does the "États-Unis" article or the biographical section include articles on such worthies as Lowell Mason, William Mason, George Frederick Root, Henry Clay Work, or any of their stripe. To itemize other typical exclusions: Beach, Bland, Bradbury, Bristow, Buck, Fry, Gleason, Hastings, Heinrich, Law, all Moravians, Pratt, Theodore Thomas, fail of notice.

Daniel Devoto, émigré Argentine (Buenos Aires, December 25, 1916) who in 1953 joined the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (directeur de recherche in 1966), contributed the signed articles on Latin American countries. Typical of his lapses are the following questionable and wrong statements: "The Roman Zipoli

¹⁴Original Dixieland Jazz Band, February 26, 1917 (Victor 18255). See *The New Grove*, ix, 564, for a caricature of the five musicians Russell Robinson (piano), Larry Shields (clarinet), Nick La Rocca (cornet), Emil Christian (trombone), and Tony Spargo (drums). "playing their own 'Livery Stable Blues.'"



arrived in Buenos Aires in 1717 and was chapelmaster at Córdoba until death (1726)"¹⁷ [I, 44]; "When King John IV [I] of Portugal left Europe in front of the Napoleonic invasion (1808) to establish himself in Brazil, he brought with him the famous Marcos Portugal"¹⁸ [I, 131]; "The national anthem of Colombia was composed by the Italian singer Oreste Giudici (1837-1904)"¹⁹ [I, 213]; "The first musician [in Mexico] of the modern period is Melesio Morales [1838-1908]; after him came Felipe Villanueva (1862-1893), creator of the *danza mexicana*, and Aniceto Ortega (died in 1875)"²⁰ [II, 47]. In the Venezuela article Devoto omits the founding father of Venezuelan music, the mulatto Juan Manuel Olivares (1760-1797); the early nineteenth-century composer recognized as the best of his epoch, José Ángel Lamas (1775-1814); and the important composer of the excellent first Venezuelan opera, José Ángel Montero (1832-1881). None of Devoto's *Larousse de la musique*, 1957 edition, articles betrays first-hand contact with the colonial patrimony of the Spanish-speaking Americas.

Devoto also supplied over 70 signed Latin American articles to volumes 2 and 3 of the three-volume *Encyclopédie de la musique* edited by François Michel in collaboration with François Lesure and Vladimir Fédorov (Paris: Fasquelle, 1958, 1959, 1961). Volume 1 contains Devoto's expansive signed article on "Musique espagnole" (pages 700-706). The extremely condensed and poorly informed articles on Argentine, Brazilian, Chilean, Colombian, and Cuban music in the same volume are by Hans Triebels, who after volume 1 disappears from the Fasquelle *Encyclopédie*. In volumes 2 and 3 Devoto himself bows to the editors' stipulation for thumbnail articles—not however without frequent misstatements in even articles of a mere half-dozen lines. Samples of needed corrections: neither Blas Galindo's *Sones de mariachi* (1940, 1941) nor his *Obertura Mexicana* (1953) is a work for an orchestra comprised solely of "autochthonous instruments";²¹ Eduardo Hernández Moncada never studied with Melesio Morales; Chumacero forms no part of the Bogotá composer Juan Herrera's names; Rodolfo Holzmann never studied with Nadia Boulanger;²² Cenobio Paniagua was not born at Tlapujahna, nor did he write "*La locomotiva*, ancestor of *Pacific 231*" (*La Locomotora Fantasía Imitativa en forma de Obertura* was composed by Melesio Morales);²³ Domingo Santa Cruz Wilson, paladin of Chilean music, did not study at any Universidad de La Cruz.

How effectually Devoto's own personal parti pris opened and closed Fasquelle's doors comes to light in his choice of biographees. Josué Teófilo Wilkes (1883-1968) enters while Carlos Vega and Lauro Ayestarán—both widely profiled in other lexicons, but both sworn enemies of Wilkes—fail to gain the succinctest of biographical articles. Devoto pays back old scores so far as Alberto Williams is concerned with these

¹⁷Zipoli was a native of Prato, not Rome; at Córdoba he completed with distinction the required three years each of philosophy and theology in the Jesuit Colegio Máximo and the University of Córdoba, but was never Córdoba cathedral *maestro de capilla*.

¹⁸Not John IV but John VI transferred his court to Brazil in 1808; Marcos Portugal did not arrive at Rio de Janeiro until 1811.

¹⁹Oreste Sindici, not Oreste Giudici, composed the Colombian national anthem.

²⁰José Mariano Elizaga (1786-1842), Joaquin Beristain (1817-1839), Cenobio Paniagua (1821-1882), José Antonio Gómez, Luis Baca (1826-1855), and Tomás León (1826-1893) preceded Melesio Morales as "inaugurator" of music in "the modern epoch"; Felipe Villanueva (1863-1893), who died at thirty, did not "create" the *danza mexicana*.

²¹*Compositores de América*, xi (Washington: Unión Panamericana [Secretaría General, Organización de los Estados Americanos, 1965]), pp. 35-36.

²²*Compositores*, iv (1958), p. 96; Antonio Iglesias, *Rudolfo Halffter* (Madrid: Editorial Alpuerto, 1979), p. 24.

²³"Morales, Melesio," *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart* 16 (Supplement), 1290.



cruel remarks: "his didactic works do not rise above elementary imitation, his poems are involuntarily laughable, and in the realms of criticism and esthetics he ranks as a complete nonentity; he is the perfect model of the American 'sanctified monster.'"²⁴ On the other hand, his own teacher, Juan Carlos Paz, is not only an "illustrious musicologist" but also "indisputably the country's [Argentina] foremost composer and an almost equally irreplaceable master and censor."²⁵ Alberto Ginastera, who already two years before Tome II (F-K) of Fasquelle had emerged in *The Musical Quarterly*, XLIII/4 (October 1957), 439-460, with a full-blown article designating him the Argentine composer, rates a paltry unsigned seven lines relegating him to mediocrity status.

The next three-volume French-language music "encyclopedia" after Fasquelle reverts to the Lavignac plan. Organized in large blocs by countries and/or cultures, the articles in the large-print *Encyclopédie des musique sacrées* edited by Jacques Porte²⁶ exceed in their scope what English-speakers conventionally refer to as "sacred music." Luxuriously produced in coffee-table style, liberally interlarded with music examples and iconography (color as well as black-and-white reproductions, often full-page), this eye-catching encyclopedia includes sections on (1) "Les musiques incas et aztèques, et leurs survivances" (I, 105-110), (2) "Le culte Vaudou" (I, 111-116), (3) "La musique rituelle des Indiens de l'Amérique du Sud-Ouest" (I, 117-125), (4) "L'Amérique latine jusqu'à la fin du XVIII^e siècle" (II, 510-521), (5) "L'Amérique latine de la fin du XVIII^e siècle à nos jours" (III, 253-265), (6) "L'Église protestante aux XVIII^e et XIX^e siècles" [États-Unis] (III, 328-334), and (7) "Expression religieuse du jazz aux États-Unis" (III, 604-606).²⁷ Hugues Panassié and Michel Perrin, authors of the last article, declare spirituals and blues to be the same music, except for texts. "Wa-wa" or "jungle" style of the Ellington Band trumpeter James (Bubber) Miley (1903-1932) they class as instrumental sermonizing. Riffs played by brass in such a group as Count Basie's equal congregational interjections during a sermon. "Jazz has been accepted worldwide, doubtless because it is religious at least in its inspiration—that is to say, music bespeaking man's relationships with his Creator," they conclude.

Marc Honegger (born Paris, May 17, 1926) began composition in 1946 with Georges Migot²⁸—whose life and works he subsequently propagated with no less filial piety than Devoto showed in nourishing the fame of his master Juan Carlos Paz. Reviews of the first two volumes of the four-volume *Dictionnaire de la musique* edited by

²⁴Fasquelle, III (1961), 919: "ses ouvrages didactiques ne dépassent pas le stade de l'imitation élémentaire; ses poésies sont involontairement comiques; en tant que critique et esthète, il est inexistant; il est le prototype du 'monstre sacré américain.'"

²⁵*Ibid.*, III, 402: "se double d'un critique hors ligne et d'un musicologue éclairé (*La música en los Estados-Unidos*, 1952, *Intr. a la mús. de nuestro tiempo*, 1955, *A. Schönberg o El fin de la era tonal*, 1958). Si le mus. est indiscutablement le 1^{er} compos. de son pays, le maître et le censeur sont presque aussi irremplaçables, et leur action se complète harmonieusement."

²⁶Born at Grenoble January 20, 1910, Jacques Porte (Fasquelle, III, 467) is a prolific composer of itemized symphonic works, ballets, an oratorio, piano works and songs, who studied at the university in his natal town and in Paris with Louis Aubert and Charles Koechlin. From 1938 to 1941 he taught music history at the Grenoble conservatory. He founded the international dance festival at Aix-les-Bains and chamber music festival at Divonne-les-Bains.

²⁷Authors: Robert Stevenson (1) and (6), Laura Boulton (2) and (3), Andrés Pardo Tovar (4) and (5), Hugues Panassié and Michel Perrin (7).

²⁸See Marc Honegger, "Migot, Georges," *Dictionnaire de la musique*, II (Paris: Bordas, 1970), 718-720 and full-page plate 132 before II, 711. Christiane Spieth-Weissenbacher wrote the article "Honegger,



Honegger (Paris: Bordas, 1970, 1970, 1976, 1976) gave it a relatively clean bill of health. François Lesure²⁹ categorized it thus in *Revue de Musicologie*, LVI/2 (1970), 231-232:

Thirteen years after Larousse, nine after Fasquelle, now behold Bordas! However, the new dictionary conforms more with the plan of the latest Riemann than with that of the two predecessor French lexicons: two purely biographical volumes will later be completed with a volume [= two volumes in 1976] devoted to subject-headings. A large group of French and foreign collaborators joined the editor of the work, Marc Honegger; more than 180 names of authors whose entries reached a certain amplitude preface volume 1. The whole work is well got up and carefully normalized. All entries achieve desirable density, works-lists are precise, and the bibliographies are usually up-to-date. Far from being a mere compilation, this dictionary registers an appreciable amount of original work that will make it useful to even the smallest musicological library.

The restrictions that publishers impose upon dictionary editors, so far as girth and other criteria go, are well known. Publishers want dictionaries addressed not so much to scholars as to the general public and the record collector. Is this the reason that musical science enjoys relatively short shrift in this dictionary and that it therefore contains a notably smaller number of entries than its two predecessor dictionaries? The victims (that is to say, the persons left out) include not only lesser musicians but also librettists, critics, and interpreters.

Compared with the nineteenth century, early epochs are overtly favored. Miniscule sixteenth-century composers (as well as a large number of organ-builders) often rate articles. Performers, even if recent French celebrities, are however in shorter supply than in Riemann. If meeting the pre-1620 François Bourgoing [1589-1660], Jacques Cellier [d. 1620], and Guillaume Morel [fl. 1620] gives pleasure, we are nonetheless taken aback when we find nothing concerning performers so renowned as Lucienne Breval [1869-1935], Emma Calvé [1858-1942], Regine Crespin [1927-], or Maurice Béjart [1927-]. The dictionary-user, after being overwhelmed with data on Georges de Scudéry [1601-1667] and Vincent Voiture [1597-1648], must consult other dictionaries if librettists so famous as Jules Barbier [1822-1901] or Du Roullet [1716-1786] are in question. Decorous attention is given contemporary composers. Certain anomalies in allotting space and various postdating juggleries do not diminish the overall value of the contemporary ensemble.

In view of the promise to keep the dictionary abreast of musicological advances, this review will mention some lapses that should not be perpetuated in future lexicographies: Dieupart's given name is François, not Charles; Adrien La Fage was born March 28, 1801;³⁰ François Joseph Nadermann was born in 1781, not 1773 and Henri Naderman in 1782, not 1780; Ockeghem died February 6, 1497 (recent discovery by M.B. Chevalier, thanks to the Archives of the Parlement de Paris); Germain Pinel died in October 1664, not 1661;³¹ Padeloup founded his concert association in 1853, not 1851; "Pirrota" is a misspelling of Pirrotta; Jean-Baptiste Stack was born at Leghorn, not Florence; Claude Antoine Terrasse was born at Arbresie near Lyons, not at Grand-Lemps near Grenoble (communication from M.L. Guichard). The portrait labeled Claudio Monteverdi [full-page colored illustration 131 credited to Oxford, Ashmolean Museum (Hill Collection)] is of more than doubtful authenticity. Otherwise the iconography is excellent.

Marc" in *The New Grove* (1980), VIII, 681-682. Six of the 15 titles itemized in his bibliography (VIII, 682) treat of Georges Migot.

²⁹Lesure himself collaborated in Bordas. None of the ten contributors credited with United States residence (among a total of 180 contributors) counts as an Americanist: Jacques Barzun, Rita Benton, Barry S. Brook, Isabelle Cazeaux, Dragan Plamenac, Kathryn Reichard, Robert Soffer, Enid M. Standing, Franklin B. Zimmerman. Luiz Heiter Corrêa de Azevedo resident in Paris is the sole listed Latin Americanist. No Canadian resident joins the contributors' list.

³⁰*Grove 5* and *The New Grove* continue giving March 30, 1805; *Baker's 5* opted for March 30, 1801; *Baker's 6* and *Brockhaus Riemann* (1979) accept March 28, 1801.

³¹*The New Grove* continues giving early October 1661.



With so many omissions already signaled by Lesure, the numerous American absences from Bordas should cause no surprise. A sample list of 30 omissions will instance the variety: Aldana, Alcedo = Alzedo, Juan de Araujo, Beach, Billings, Campa, Ricardo Castro, Ceruti, Ignacio Cervantes, Hernando Franco, García Morillo, Carlos Gardel, Holden, Holyoke, Jerusalem, Scott Joplin, Jerome Kern, Law, Lôbo e Mesquita, López Capillas, James Lyon, Nunó, Orejón y Aparicio, Padilla, John Frederik Peter, Rochberg, Richard Rodgers, Root, Slonimsky,¹² Torrejón y Velasco. On the other hand, Bordas includes Heinrich, Hopkinson, Melesio Morales, and lunes Garcia. The vagaries of American omissions and inclusions therefore imply no anti-American bias but merely reflect on the generally haphazard selection criteria that governed Bordas's biographical choices.

PORTUGAL

José Mazza, eighteenth-century native of Lisbon who died there December 14, 1797, "antedated all other European music lexicographers by a century in including composers of the Western Hemisphere, among them contemporaries who were just coming to prominence, and composers of African descent."¹ Himself descended from a family of Parma violinists contracted for the Lisbon court before 1709, José Mazza combined the virtues of performer, composer,² poet,³ translator,⁴ and pioneer dictionary writer.⁵

Mazza's prefatory matter mentions sixteen Brazilians—four contemporaneously active at Bahia,⁶ colonial capital until 1763, four associated with places near Bahia,⁷ and seven from the then new capital of Rio de Janeiro.⁸ The main entry series,

¹²Slonimsky wrote the "États-Unis" article in the Honegger dictionary, *Science de la Musique Formes, technique, Instruments A-K* volume (1976), pp. 351-356.

¹"Mazza, José," *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians* (London: Macmillan, 1980), i, 866.

²His *Cançoneta e Minuete* extracted from a pastorela that he wrote to celebrate the birthday March 1, 1791, of his patron who in 1805 founded the Biblioteca Pública of Évora, Manuel do Cenáculo Vilas-Boas, Ars Cod. CLI/2-8, n.º 3 for its call number in that library. See José Augusto Alegria, *Biblioteca Pública de Évora Catálogo dos Fundos Musicais* (Lisbon: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, 1977), p. 70. Composed for paired sopranos accompanied by two violins, cello or bass, this birthday tribute struck Ernesto Vieira, *Dicionário Biográfico de Músicos Portuguezes* (Lisbon: Mattos Moreira & Pinheiro, 1900), II, 77, as "extremely graceful music."

³Alegria, editor of Mazza's *Dicionário biográfico de músicos portugueses* (Lisbon: Extraído da Revista Ocidente" [Tipografia da Editorial Império, Lda.], 1944/1945), p. 11, counted 17 poems and 6 letters addressed to Mazza's patron who became bishop of Beja in 1770 and archbishop of Évora in 1802.

⁴His Portuguese translation of Tomás de Iriarte's *La Música* dedicated to his patron is in the Évora library founded by his patron.

⁵Manuscript of 97 leaves catalogued cxiv/1-26d by Joaquim Heliodoro da Cunha Rivara, *Catálogo dos manuscritos da Bibliotheca Pública Eborense* (1870), III, 482, with the factitious title *Dicionário Biográfico de Músicos portugueses e notícia das suas composições por José Mazza*.

⁶"José Sostinha, priest, chapelmaster, composer, tenor singer; António Mathias, teacher and composer, amounting contralto singer; Frei Mathias, Carmelite priest, composer, and chapelmaster, organ builder and outstanding organ player, tenor singer; José de Santa Maria, composer, poet, player of numerous instruments, excellent singer, and so versatile in all styles and genres that he can convert the emotions from tremble sadness to gladness. He plays the guitar so well that he can repeat on the guitar with equal grace and beauty the same verses that he has just sung."

⁷"José da Cruz, teacher, composer, and contralto singer at Sergipipe; José Francisco, priest, composer, chapelmaster, contralto singer, grammar teacher, Latin and Portuguese versifier, at Santo Amaro; José Manoel, teacher and composer; Frei Luis de Jesus, priest, organist, composer, excellent contralto singer, at São Francisco."

⁸"Florentino, married mulatto, lives from his musical occupations; Francisco de Paula, clergyman who



alphabetized according to Portuguese principles popularized by Diogo Barbosa Machado (1682-1772),⁹ itemizes the following eight Brazilians:

Antonio Alves, secular priest and native of Pernambuco, not only a learned musical composer but also a trained theologian.

Caetano de Mello [de Jesus], native of Bahia, composed various works for four and more voices. He wrote an "Art of Mensural Music" in dialogue form and a "Treatise on Tones," extant at Bahia and Pernambuco.

Euzébio de Mattos, born at Bahia in 1629, transferred from the Society of Jesus to the Carmelite order. A famous musical composer, he was so erudite in other arts and sciences that the famous António Vieira called him a paragon in everything. After 33 years as a Jesuit and 15 as a Carmelite he died in 1692 at the Carmelite convento in Bahia, aged 63. Frei Manoel de Sá, *Memórias Históricas dos Escritores Portugueses do Carmen*, chapter 24, page 140, mentions him.

Jerónimo de Sousa Pereira,¹⁰ mulatto secular priest and chapelmaster of São Pedro Gonzalves at Recife, Pernambuco, taught counterpoint to many advanced students in Pernambuco and its environs. He was also a composer.

Ignácio nicknamed the "Bandore" (*bandurra*) because he played that instrument so perfectly, was a native of the City of Bahia. He composed only popular pieces for two and more voices (*modas a Duo, e mais vozes*), which were however utterly delightful (*engraçadíssimas*).

Luis Álvares Pinto, mulatto native of Pernambuco, excellent Portuguese and Latin poet, very well versed in both the French and Italian tongues. A fine accompanist whether playing cello, guitar, or violin, he went to Lisbon to study counterpoint with the famous Henrique da Silva.¹¹ He composed innumerable works of highest quality for church use. For the exequies of King José I [1714-1777] he wrote funeral music for four choirs. Also he has written some admirable secular works.

Nuno da Cunha,¹² native of Pernambuco where he is considered their best composer up to the present. His compatriots attest his composing for four to eight voices without recourse to a score. Some enemies to test him purloined a voice part of a Mass. Immediately he wrote out all the other voice parts and then at sight added the missing voice part.

teaches:— São Joaquim Seminary, native of Santa Catherina Island, son of Felipe Gonzales and Thereza de Jesus; José Maurício Nunes Garcia, mulatto priest, native of Rio de Janeiro, baptized in Candelária parish; Frei Jerónimo, Carmelite, son of Joaquim Pedro and Antónia Maria do Sacramento; Salvador José, mulatto son of João Bautista and Quiteria, native of Rio de Janeiro, baptized in São José parish; Joaquim Lopes, priest, chapelmaster of Rio de Janeiro Cathedral, son of João Pedro; Frei Pedro, organist of Santo António convento, son of Pedro Ferreira, chaplain, and Maria do Nascimento, baptized in Candelária parish."

⁹*The New Grove*, II, 144. Barbosa Machado identified José Pereira de Santa Anna (1691-1759) and João Seyxas da Fonseca (1691-1758) as natives of Rio de Janeiro (*Bibliotheca Lusitana*, II [1747], 886 and 750).

¹⁰Concerning him, see Marcos António Marcondes, ed., *Enciclopédia da música brasileira: erudita, folclórica, e popular* (São Paulo, Art Editora, 1977), II, 603. This 1977 encyclopedia article summarizes Jaime C. Diniz's *Músicos pernambucanos do passado*, II (Recife: Universidade Federal de Pernambuco, 1971), 45-64.

¹¹Henrique da Silva Negrão signed a testimonial for Francisco Inácio Solano's 1764 *Nova Instrução Musical* February 18, 1763 (Carta sexta). Organist of Santa Maria basilica in Lisbon, he joined the Saint Cecilia brotherhood February 19, 1761, and died in 1791. See Ernesto Vieira, II, 116.

Further data concerning Pinto in "Some Portuguese Sources for Early Brazilian Music History," *Yearbook Inter-American Institute for Musical Research*, IV (1968), 13-20; Diniz, *Músicos pernambucanos do passado*, I (1969), 43-100. Concerning Pinto's 1761 *Arte de solfejar* edited by Diniz in 1977, see *Inter-American Music Review*, I/2 (Spring-Summer, 1979), 242-243.

¹²"Some Portuguese Sources," *Yearbook*, IV (1968), 24, cites Francisco Curt Lange's opinion that "Nuno da Cunha exposed Marcos Portugal's thefts from other composers palmed off as his own inventions."



Teodoro Fernandes Moreno, native of the city of Bahia and a very skilled contrapuntist, has composed numerous well-made works.

After Mazza, Portuguese musical lexicography languished until 1870 when the then 21-year-old Joaquim António da Fonseca Vasconcellos (1849–1936) published at Oporto his handsome two-volume *Os Músicos Portuguezes. Biographia—Bibliographia*. Scion of a wealthy Oporto family able to pay for his education at Hamburg,¹³ Vasconcellos invested 900\$000 reis of his own personal funds to pay publication costs of a work that in the first thirty months sold a mere 80 copies. Among Brazilians, he itemized José Mauricio Nunes Garcia (I, 114–116), Manuel Joaquim (I, 170) Eusébio de Mattos (I, 229), Bernardo José de Souza Queiroz (II, 133–134), and Telles (II, 199). In addition he listed Marcos Portugal's operas and other dramatic works performed at Rio de Janeiro after joining João VI there (II, 79, 83).

To Vasconcellos's discomfiture, *Os Músicos Portuguezes*¹⁴ endured severe criticism at home and abroad.¹⁵ Rather than publishing a corrected edition, Vasconcellos himself preferred to invest his own later energies in republication (1874) and analysis (1873) of the *Primeira parte do index da livraria de musica do myto alto, e poderoso Rey Dom João o IV. Nosso Senhor* (Lisbon: Paulo Craesbeck, 1649), a copy of which he encountered in the Paris Bibliothèque nationale,¹⁶ and in other enterprises culminating in his sumptuous *El-Rey D. João o 4.^o* (Oporto: Typographia Universal, A Vapor, 1900–1905). Meanwhile he loftily spurned the scholarship of Ernesto Vieira (1848–1915),¹⁷ whose *Diccionario biographico de músicos portuguezes. História e*

¹³Esteves Pereira and Guilherme Rodrigues, eds., *Portugal Diccionario Histórico, Chorográfico, Biográfico, Bibliográfico* (Lisbon: João Romano Torres & C.^a, 1915), VII, 325–326, identify his father as the businessman and Tuscan consul general in Oporto, José António da Fonseca Vasconcellos. "From 1859 to August of 1865 he studied at Hamburg in a private school (Harms). Upon leaving Hamburg, he visited most of Germany, Denmark, France, and England—not returning to Portugal until 1865. From that year to 1869 he studied at Coimbra University. Without taking a degree he returned to Germany in 1869, only to find the nation on the brink of war with France. In 1870 he published *Os Músicos Portuguezes*, a work strongly resisted in many quarters."

¹⁴Vasconcellos, *Ensaio critico sobre o Catálogo d'El-Rey D. João IV* (Oporto: Imprensa Portugueza, 1873), p. 5, confessed that in the three years since having published *Os Músicos Portuguezes* he had found another 400 names deserving entry.

¹⁵"Os Músicos Portuguezes" in *El-Rey D. João o 4.^o* (Oporto: Typographia Universal, 1900–1905), p. 355. Marcellino Menéndez y Pelayo flayed it in *Historia de las ideas estéticas en España*, II, 685. Only Francisco Asenjo Barbieri's review, "Estudio bibliográfico-musical," *Revista de España*, XIX (April, 1871), 351–360, conceded the merits of *Os Músicos Portuguezes*.

¹⁶For comment, see Mário de Sampayo Ribeiro, *Livraria de música de El-Rei D. João IV Estudo Musical, Histórico e Bibliográfico* (Lisbon: Academia Portuguesa da História, 1967), I (Nótulas de Bibliografia Musical), pp. 13–17. Vasconcellos, *Ensaio*, p. 3, credited Barbieri with having "discovered" John IV's catalogue.

¹⁷*Portugal Diccionario*, VIII, 455–456. Vieira's father, a captain in the merchant marine, died in Angola shortly before his birth. Left with six children to support, his mother, Anna Julia Vieira, found employment in the silk industry. She was able to place Ernesto aged 6 to 8 in an orphan asylum. After cruel hardships and only four months of formal schooling, he entered the Conservatório Nacional at age 12—the conservatory being in 1860 the only Lisbon institution that offered free instruction. Specializing in flute, he also briefly studied piano and oboe until the necessity of earning a livelihood drove him to teaching and orchestral playing. He played second oboe in the São Carlos theatre orchestra six years. In 1888 he began teaching piano in the Lisbon Escola Acadêmica, and for thirteen years he taught musical rudiments, harmony, and flute in the Lisbon Academia dos Amadores de Música. For a list of his musicological writings published chiefly in *Amphion* and *A Arte musical* from 1886 to 1909, see Maria Augusta Alves Barbosa, *Vincentius Lusitanus ein portugiesischer Komponist und Musiktheoretiker des 16. Jahrhunderts* (Lisbon: Secretaria de Estado da Cultura, Direcção-Geral do Património Cultural, 1977), pp. 492–493.



bibliographia da música em Portugal (Lisbon: Mattos Moreira & Pinheiro, 1900, 2 volumes)¹⁸ nonetheless quickly supplanted Vasconcellos's precocious lexicon among cognoscenti.¹⁹

Vieira's biographies include sixteen Brazilians plus another three musicians who spent appreciable time in Brazil.²⁰ As samples, the earliest three Brazilians for whom he could specify exact birth dates were:²¹

Noya (Ignácio Ribeiro), born at Recife, Pernambuco, October 5, 1688, studied there in the Jesuit College of São Patrício. After being ordained priest he became chapelmaster of the *igreja matriz* at Recife, where, on October 28, 1734, he signed a document contained in Caetano de Mello de Jesus's *Escola de Canto de Orgão*, Parte II (1760), pp. 531-532.

Sant'Anna (frei José Pereira de), born at Rio de Janeiro, February 4, 1696, was the son of the Portuguese Simão Pereira de Sá and a mother of French descent. Before he professed in 1715 in the Calced Carmelite order he went by the name of José Pereira de Sá Bacon. Already in youth he composed both sacred and secular music that retained popularity in Brazil throughout his lifetime. After obtaining the doctorate in theology at Coimbra May 17, 1725, he spent a decade teaching in Brazil. In 1740 his colleagues in Portugal chose him to write a history of the Carmelite order, the first two volumes of which were published at Lisbon in 1745 and 1751. His *Dissertação apologética* appended to the second volume contains valuable musical data. He died at Salvaterra (Portugal) January 31, 1759.

Alcântara (Antônio da Silva), native of Recife, was born there October 19, 1711. Already at age 14 he was winning local laurels with his compositions. He also became proficient on numerous instruments. After being ordained priest he was invited to become chapelmaster of Olinda Cathedral. His compositions include two Masses; Te Deum for four choirs and orchestra sung at the Carmelite Church in Recife; Te Deum for double choir sung in the Misericórdia; Ladainha in E \flat for four voices with obbligato.

Following Vieira, the next music lexicon to fill the Portuguese void took for its subject matter the whole art of music. Credited jointly to the pedagogue Tomás Borba (Angra do Heroísmo, November 23, 1867; Lisbon, February 12, 1950) and the composer Fernando Lopes Graça (Tomar, December 17, 1906), the two-volume *Dicionário de Música (ilustrado)* published at Lisbon by Edições Cosmos in 1956 [A-H] and 1958 [I-Z] (674, 751 pp.) enlisted also six other Portuguese collaborators (Bragança Gil, José Carlos Picoto, João José Cochofel, Ruben Garcia, Seabra Dinis, Silvério Marques

¹⁸Vieira began his preface by accusing Vasconcellos of having rifled Diogo Barbosa Machado's indexed four-volume *Bibliotheca Lusitana* (1741-1758) and F.-J. Fêtis's *Biographie universelle des musiciens* for most of *Os Músicos Portuguezes*, adding only what information he could throw together without any personal research. Vieira based his own dictionary on more than two decades of archival research at Lisbon and Évora.

¹⁹Vasconcellos, *El-Rei D. João o 4.^{to}*, pp. 357-359, in turn accused the "rich, idle" Platon L'vovich Vaksel' (1844-1919) of having plagiarized his 61-page *Abriss der Geschichte der portugiesischen Musik* (Berlin: R. Oppenheim, 1883) from José Joaquim Marques (1836-1884).

²⁰Antônio da Silva Alcântara (I, 8), Damião Barbosa de Araujo (I, 43-44), José Mauricio Nunes Garcia (I, 450-454), Antônio Carlos Gomes (I, 467-477), Henrique Edalio Gurjão (I, 479-481), Caetano de Mello [de] Jesus (I, 499-500), Joaquina Maria da Conceição da Lapa (II, 14), João Leal (II, 17-18), Agostinho Leite (II, 19), Alexandre Levy (II, 31-33), João de Lima (II, 35-36), Raphael Coelho Machado (II, 49-52), João Cyrillo Moniz (II, 97-98), Sigsmund Neukomm (II, 116-117), Ignácio Ribeiro Pinto (II, 135), Luiz Álvares Pinto (II, 184-185), João dos Reis (II, 248-249), José Pereira de Sant'Anna (II, 270), Francisco Manuel da Silva (II, 302-304).

²¹Vieira's source for Alcântara and Noya: Domingos Loreto Couto, "Desagravos do Brazil e Glorias de Pernambuco," Biblioteca Nacional (Lisbon), MS F.G. 873 (olim B. 16/23); Alcântara at pp. 385-386, Manuel de Almeida Botelho at 394-395; João de Lima at 397-398.



Pereira de Campos). So far as Borba's own personal contribution goes (he was already long dead when the first volume appeared), he wrote only subject-matter articles. Even these did not include the ill-informed articles on both Brazilian (I, 223-227) and Portuguese (II, 397-399) music that bear Fernando Lopes Graça's initials.

Lopes Graça's sense of self-importance comes forcibly into view when comparison is made of the eight-column article that he allowed himself (II, 137-140) with the six columns allotted Heitor Villa-Lobos, the two given Camargo Guarnieri (I, 603-604), one each given Carlos Chávez and Manuel Ponce, none allowed Alberto Ginastera. Apparently Lopes Graça conceded some value to political affiliations. Musicians who sided with the Spanish Republic of 1931—Pau Casals, Rodolfo Halffter, Silvestre Revueltas, and Adolfo Salazar, for instance—emerge with exceptional honor.

Among United States credits, Louis Gruenberg and Lazare Saminsky rate longer articles than those on Leonard Bernstein and George Gershwin. Gershwin's compositions include "a second *Rhapsody in Blue*, a collection called *Jazz piano preludes*, and an opera in one act titled *135th Street*" (I, 566). Ragtime and blues are branches of jazz ("o *ragtime*, que veio a designar um dos muitos tipos da música de *jazz blues* (que veio a constituir também um tipo especial)" [II, 44]). Jazz takes its name, according to Lopes Graça, author of the long article on jazz (II, 43-47), either from Jasbo Brown, the Black who played in a Chicago café around 1914, or from Charles (Chas) Washington, or from the French word *jazer* current in New Orleans at the turn of the century; or perhaps from none of these.

The seven most important United States composers according to the main text of the *Americano* article (I, 62) were: "Mac Dowell, Bird, Brislow, Mason, Bucks, Frys, Chadwich, Muller, Morrison."²² To this misspelled list Lopes Graça adds in a footnote another twelve (beginning with his favorite Saminsky) rated as "most representative of contemporary American music; although it must be added without having as yet made much of a dent in European consciousness." *Hail Columbia* with "music by Phile" notated in the key of A flat is the "patriotic hymn of the United States" (I, 62).

This richly illustrated dictionary contains portraits of no United States or Spanish American composers but does include likenesses of the Brazilians José Mauricio Nunes Garcia (alphabetized under "M" [II, 198], António Carlos Gomes (I, 581), Alberto Nepomuceno (1864-1920) [II, 288], António Francisco Braga (1868-1945 [I, 219]), Villa-Lobos (II, 681), Francisco Mignone (II, 228), and Cláudio Santoro (II, 498). The article on Gomes contains this startling statement: after *Maria Tudor* he returned to Rio de Janeiro, "onde é recebido com manifestações da mais alta consideração, que incluíram a libertação dos escravos" ("where he was received with marks of the highest consideration, which included the freeing of the slaves"). None of Gomes's opera plots is synopsisized, nor for that matter are any of the plots of operas by Portuguese composers. On the other hand, opera plots of every standard opera from *Aida* (I, 43-44) to *Wozzeck* (II, 733-734) are itemized by acts and scenes.

²²Bernardo Valentim Moreira de Sá (1853-1924) published "Compositores de América do Norte," in *Arte Musical* [Lisbon], IV/99 (February 15, 1903), 26. According to him, MacDowell showed strong Scottish influence. The seven other leading United States composers in 1903, according to this world-renowned Portuguese violinist who had toured America, were John Knowles Paine, Edgar Stillman Kelley, Harvey Worthington Loomis, Ethelbert Nevin, Henry Schoenefeld, [Maurice] Arnold, and [John Herbert] Clifford. The last-named person (if rightly identified) was a music handbook compiler, not a composer.